# Trace element analysis provides insight into the diets of early Late Miocene ungulates from the Rudabánya II locality (Hungary)

L.C. EASTHAM<sup>1</sup> R.S. FERANEC<sup>2</sup> D.R. BEGUN<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Anthropology Department, University of Toronto

19 Russell Street, Toronto, ON M5S 2S2, Canada. Eastham E-mail: laura.eastham@mail.utoronto.ca Begun E-mail: begun@chass.utoronto.ca

<sup>2</sup>Research and Collections, New York State Museum

3140 Cultural Education Center, Albany, New York, 12230, United States. E-mail: robert.feranec@nysed.gov

# 

The early Late Miocene vertebrate locality of Rudabánya II (R. II) in northeastern Hungary preserves an abundance of forest-adapted ungulate species. To better understand the ecological relationships within this ancient ecosystem, we used analysis of enamel strontium/calcium (Sr/Ca) ratios to infer dietary preferences. The goals of the analysis were to: i) determine whether these ungulate species specialized in specific plants or plant parts; ii) discern whether the Sr/Ca ratios support what was previously suggested about the ecology of these species and iii) evaluate the factors that may have acted to promote coexistence within this diverse community of predominantly browsing herbivores. Results show significant differences in the diets of the sampled species. The highest Sr/Ca ratios were displayed by the suids Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii (FORTELIUS et al., 2005) and Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus (PILGRIM, 1926) implying a preference for Sr-rich underground plant parts. Elevated Sr/Ca ratios yielded by the cervid Lucentia aff. pierensis (THOMAS, 1951) and equid Hippotherium intrans (KRETZOI, 1983) are indicative of intermediate feeding. The bovid *Miotragocerus* sp. (STROMER, 1928) showed higher Sr/Ca ratios than the gomphothere Tetralophodon longirostris (KAUP, 1832), which is incongruent with morphological and stable isotope data, and suggested browsing by both taxa. This finding is likely the result of a difference in digestive physiology (ruminant vs. monogastric) rather than a difference in dietary behaviour. The lowest Sr/Ca ratios were displayed by the traguild *Dorcatherium naui* (KAUP AND SCHOLL, 1834) and moschid *Micromeryx flourensianus* (LARTET, 1851) suggesting a preference for Sr-poor fruits. Resource specialization and partitioning within the local environment likely acted to decrease interspecific competition and promote coexistence within the diverse ungulate community at R. II.

*KEYWORDS* Paleoecology. Sr/Ca ratios. Late Miocene. Ungulates. Hungary.

## INTRODUCTION

The relative concentration of strontium to calcium (Sr/Ca) in mammalian bioapatite has proven to be an effective

indicator of trophic level, dietary behavior, and habitat use in both modern and ancient ecosystems (Elias *et al.*, 1982; Sillen, 1986; Sealy and Sillen, 1988; Sillen *et al.*, 1992; Gilbert *et al.*, 1994; Burton *et al.*, 1999; Blum *et*  al., 2000; Balter et al., 2002; 2012; Palmqvist et al., 2003; Lee-Thorp et al., 2003; Balter, 2004; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Domingo et al., 2012; Peek and Clementz, 2012; Qu et al., 2013; de Winter et al., 2016). Strontium is a non-essential trace element, which mammals discriminate against relative to Ca in their intestines, kidneys, sites of bioapatite formation, and across the placenta and mammary glands (Taylor et al., 1962; Lengemann, 1963; Walser and Robinson, 1963; Underwood, 1977; Sasaki and Garant, 1986; Avioli, 1988; Rossipal et al., 2000; Chattopadhyay et al., 2007). This results in herbivore tissues having lower Sr/Ca ratios than the plants they consume and carnivores having lower Sr/Ca ratios than their prey (Elias et al., 1982; Burton et al., 1999; Blum et al., 2000). Systematic variations in Sr/Ca ratios also occur within trophic levels and can be used to assess the relative dietary contribution of certain plants and plant parts (Rao, 1979; Runia, 1987; Burton et al., 1999; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Domingo et al., 2012). Due to a decrease in Sr concentration that occurs during xylem transport (centripetal accumulation) plant roots and stems have higher Sr/Ca ratios than leaves and fruits (Bowen and Dymond, 1955; Runia, 1987; Sillen, 1992; Burton et al., 1999; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Drouet and Herbauts, 2008). Grasses have been shown to have higher concentrations of Sr than the leaves of dicotyledonous plants (Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006). By analyzing the Sr/Ca ratios of sympatric mammalian herbivores it is possible to evaluate differences in dietary resource use and gain a better understanding of the factors that act to promote species coexistence. Here we use Sr/Ca ratios of fossil tooth enamel to evaluate dietary resource use within the ungulate community at Rudabánya II (R. II), an early Late Miocene (early Vallesian; ~10Ma) vertebrate locality in northeastern Hungary. The faunal assemblage at R. II preserves an abundance of forest-adapted fauna and presents a unique opportunity to examine species coexistence during a dynamic period in the evolution of terrestrial ecosystems in Europe.

During the early Vallesian (11.2–9.7Ma), mammalian communities in central and western Europe achieved exceptionally high levels of species diversity (Agustí *et al.*, 1997, 2003, 2013; Franzen and Stroch, 1999; Daxner-Höck, 2004; Bernor *et al.*, 2004; Casanovas-Vilar *et al.*, 2014, 2016). The entry of new woodland-adapted immigrant taxa (hipparione horses, giraffids, and boselaphine bovids) during this time is not associated with the local extinction of forest-adapted faunas (Agustí *et al.*, 1997; Franzen and Stroch, 1999), suggesting low levels of competition. This period of optimum diversity was followed by the decline of forest-dwelling browsers and rise of woodland-adapted mixed-feeders and grazers (Fortelius *et al.*, 2002). It was traditionally hypothesized that the diversity of forest-adapted taxa decreased abruptly at the early/late Vallesian

boundary (~9.7Ma) in a faunal turnover event termed the Vallesian Crisis (Agustí and Moyà-Solà, 1990; Agustí *et al.*, 1997, 1999, 2003, 2013; Fortelius *et al.*, 1996; Fortelius and Hokkanen, 2001). However, more recent analysis suggests that the demise of forest-dwelling communities occurred gradually through a series of extinction events that began in the late Vallesian/early Turolian (Franzen *et al.*, 2013; Casanovas-Vilar *et al.*, 2014, 2016; Daxner-Höck *et al.*, 2016).

To better understand how early Vallesian ecosystem functioned it is necessary to examine the complex ecological relationships that occurred within each trophic level. In this study, we use Sr/Ca ratios to evaluate the diets of early Vallesian ungulates with the aim of determining: i) whether the sampled ungulate species show specialization for specific plants or plant parts, ii) whether Sr/Ca ratios support what is known about the ecology of these particular ungulate species from other methods, and iii) what factors may have acted to maintain coexistence within this diverse community of predominantly browsing herbivores.

#### **GEOLOGICAL SETTING**

Rudabánya is an early Late Miocene (early Vallesian) vertebrate paleontological locality situated within the Pannonian Basin, on the western flank of the northern Carpathian Mountains, in northeastern Hungary (N48°22'48.13", E20°37'43.57"; Fig. 1). There are several vertebrate localities within the Rudabánya complex; the current study analyzes fauna from the R. II locality. The fossiliferous deposits at Rudabánya accumulated near the shoreline of Lake Pannon, which formed at approximately 11.6Ma (Kázmér, 1990; Rögl, 1998; Magyar *et al.*, 1999;



**FIGURE 1.** The Pannonian Basin with estimated maximum extension of Lake Pannon at *ca*. 10Ma indicated by white shading. Black diamond marks position of Rudabánya (N48°22'48.13", E20°37'43.57"). Black circles indicate position of Belgrade, Bucharest, Budapest, Vienna, and Zagreb for reference (modified from Rögl, 1998; Magyar *et al.*, 1999; Popov *et al.*, 2004).

Popov et al., 2004). Lake Pannon reached its maximum extent (c 290,000km<sup>2</sup>) between 10.5-10Ma, during a period of high precipitation and humidity (Magyar et al., 1999; Harzhauser and Mandic, 2004; Harzhauser, 2007; Harzhauser et al., 2008; Utescher et al., 2017). During this period coastal environments were characterized by extensive marshes grading into forested-wetlands, and mixed evergreen and deciduous forest (Kretzoi et al., 1976; Erdei et al., 2007; Harzhauser et al., 2008; Halby and Erdei, 2013; Utescher et al., 2017). Palaeobotanical remains from R. II reflect a swamp association dominated by deciduous taxa (Kretzoi et al., 1976; Halby and Erdei, 2013). Stable isotope analysis of 10 species of ungulates from R. II indicates a variable forest environment, which included both open and closed canopy habitats (Eastham et al., 2016).

The depositional sequence at R. II is comprised of cyclic layers of clay, mud, and lignite totaling 8-12 meters. While the sequence is too short to tie into the geomagnetic timescale, the evolutionary stage of the fauna suggests it belongs near the top of the MN9 land mammal zone (10-9.8Ma) (Kordos, 1991; Andrews et al., 1996; Bernor et al., 2003; Andrews and Cameron, 2010; Casanovas-Vilar et al., 2011). The current study analyzes fauna from the black mud and gray marl depositional layers as one community. A lack of faunistic difference has been observed between these depositional layers suggesting that they sample overlapping communities (Kordos and Begun, 2002). Stable isotope analysis showed no significant difference in the values of fauna from the black mud and gray marl indicating little, if any, change in environmental conditions (Eastham et al., 2011).

With 112 vertebrate species, including 69 species of mammals, R. II represents one of the richest early Vallesian palaeontological sites in Europe. The majority of the ungulate taxa are morphologically inferred as browsers including *Dorcatherium naui* (Tragulidae; KAUP AND SCHOLL, 1834), *Micromeryx flourensianus* (Moschidae; LARTET, 1851), Miotragocerus sp. (Bovidae; STROMER, 1928), Tapirus cf. priscus (Tapiridae; KAUP, 1833), Chalicotherium aff. goldfussi (Chalioctheriidae; KAUP, 1833), Hoploaceratherium belvederense (Wang, 1929), Aceratherium incisivum (KAUP, 1832) and Lartetotherium aff. sansaniensis (LARTET, 1851) (Rhinocerotidae), and Tetralophodon longirostris (Gomphotheriidae; KAUP, 1832). Suid taxa include a suine, Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus (PILGRIM, 1926), first known from the Middle Miocene, and a primitive tetraconodont, Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii (FORTELIUS et al., 2005). The equid Hippotherium intrans (KRETZOI, 1983), a derived member of the Hippotherium lineage, shows morphological adaptations suggestive of more cursorial behaviour (Bernor et al., 2003, 2004; Scott et al., 2005). Patterns of meso- and microwear, as well as and stable isotope values indicate that the equid was an intermediate feeder (engaged in both browsing and grazing; Merceron et al., 2007; Tütken et al., 2013; Eastham et al., 2016). Intermediate feeding has also been interpreted for the cervid Lucentia aff. pierensis on the basis of meso- and microwear and stable isotopes (Merceron et al., 2007; Eastham et al., 2016). R. II is one of the very few Late Miocene sites in Eurasia that preserves extensive samples of both a hominoid and pliopithecoid (Andrews et al., 1997: Harrison, 2002; Kordos and Begun, 2002; Armour-Chelu et al., 2005). Rudapithecus hungaricus (KRETZOI, 1969) and Anapithecus hernyaki (KRETZOI, 1975) have been recovered from the same depositional layers supporting the assumption of sympatry in these fossil primates (Andrews et al., 1997; Kordos and Begun, 2002; Armour-Chelu et al., 2005).

# MATERIALS AND METHODS

All of the faunas sampled in the current study were recovered from the R. II locality within the Rudabánya complex. A total of 45 enamel samples from eight genera of medium to large-bodied mammals were analyzed

TABLE 1. Descriptive statistics for the R. II ungulate species analyzed in this study. SD indicates the standard deviation

Taxon	Family	Ν	Sr/Ca x 1000				
			Mean	SD		Range	
Dorcatherium naui	Tragulidae	4	0.52	0.13	0.45	То	0.70
Hippotherium intrans	Equidae	8	0.89	0.23	0.62	То	1.21
Lucentia aff. pierensis	Cervidae	9	0.92	0.27	0.60	То	1.26
Micromeryx flourensianus	Moschidae	6	0.57	0.16	0.31	То	0.73
<i>Miotragocerus</i> sp.	Bovidae	8	0.82	0.22	0.58	То	1.20
Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii	Suidae	4	1.54	0.38	1.25	То	2.08
Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus	Suidae	4	1.22	0.19	0.98	То	1.42
Tetralophodon longirostris	Gomphotheriidae	2	0.77	0.05	0.73	То	0.80

(Table 1). Bedrock geology controls groundwater and soil trace element concentrations, making the direct comparison of trace element ratios from plants and animals living in different regions quite difficult (Sillen and Kavanagh, 1982; Sealy and Sillen, 1988; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Kohn et al., 2013). There has been extensive work examining the post mortem incorporation of trace elements into mammalian bones and teeth (Kyle, 1986; Price et al., 1992; Trueman and Tuross, 2002). In fact, trace element ratios of fossil bone have been proposed as a proxy for fossil provenance based upon the presumed prominent incorporation of trace elements through diagenesis (Trueman and Benton, 1997; Ségalen et al., 2008; Tutken et al., 2011; Herwartz et al., 2013; Kohn and Moses, 2013). Enamel was chosen for analysis over bone or dentine in this study because of its resistance to diagenetic alteration, due in part to its greater mineral content and lack of natural pores, and because it repeatedly has been shown to reliably reflect originally incorporated geochemical values (Lee-Thorp and van der Merwe, 1987, 1991; Wang and Cerling, 1994; Kohn et al., 1999; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 1999; 2006; Fourie et al., 2008; Tutken et al., 2008; Domingo et al., 2009, 2012; Brügmann et al., 2012). The exact mechanisms controlling trace element uptake in mammalian bioapatites are not completely understood and are thought to vary per element (Burton and Price, 2002; Kohn et al., 2013). However, the uptake of trace elements through drinking water is generally thought to be too low to account for the concentrations found in teeth and bone, and instead it is suggested that diet and the ingestion of soil and dust account for in vivo trace element incorporation (Underwood, 1977; Sillen, 1992; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Kohn et al., 2013). While the majority of previous trace element studies have focused on Plio-Pleistocene and Holocene fossil material, works by Domingo et al. (2009, 2012) and Eberle et al. (2009) have shown the preservation of biogenic signals in Middle Miocene and Early Oligocene mammalian tooth enamel. Because the goal of our analysis was to examine variation in the feeding behaviour of adult animals, we preferentially sampled teeth that are among the last to develop, mineralize, and erupt (Hillson, 2005). Enamel (~10mg) was removed using a low speed FOREDOM<sup>™</sup> drill and carbide dental burs. 2-3mm wide samples were taken along the non-occlusal surface parallel to the growth axis across the entire length of the tooth, which provides average values of resource use during tooth development, typically representing many months to a few years.

Samples were chemically pretreated with hydrogen peroxide  $(30\%, H_2O_2)$  to remove organics and weak acetic acid  $(0.1N, CH_3CO_2H)$  to remove secondary carbonates (Koch *et al.*, 1997). Samples were centrifuged at a high speed and rinsed in distilled water to neutral pH before proceeding with the next solution. The remaining sample (~5mg) was then dissolved in 1ml of HNO<sub>3</sub> in closed teflon beakers. After complete dissolution the beakers were opened and the samples evaporated to dryness on a hotplate. The residue was then dissolved in 0.5ml of 6N HNO<sub>3</sub> and evaporated to dryness, then dissolved again 0.5ml of 2.5N HNO<sub>3</sub> and evaporated to dryness. Prior to analysis the samples were dissolved in 1ml of 2% HNO<sub>3</sub> solution. Sr and Ca concentrations were analyzed by using an Element XR<sup>TM</sup> inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometer (ICP-MS) at the University of California, Santa Cruz. The precision of the ICP-MS is better than +/-2-4%. Sr and Ca data are presented here as ratios multiplied by 1000 (e g. Sr/Ca x 1000) (Sillen 1992; Balter et al., 2002; Palmqvist et al., 2003; Lee-Thorp et al., 2003; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Domingo et al., 2009, 2012). Sr/Ca ratios were compared among taxa using both parametric (ANOVA, Fisher's LSD) and non-parametric (Kruskal-Wallis) tests where appropriate. Statistical analyses were run on SPSS 22.0, with significance set at p < 0.05.

## RESULTS

The Sr/Ca ratios of the R. II fauna (Table 1; Fig. 1; Table I in the Appendix) are comparable with those reported for both modern (Elias *et al.*, 1982; Gilbert *et al.*, 1994; Burton *et al.*, 1999; Peek and Clementz, 2012; Martin *et al.*, 2015) and fossil mammals (Balter *et al.*, 2002, 2012; Lee-Thorp *et al.*, 2003; Palmqvist *et al.*, 2003; Sponheimer *et al.*, 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Domingo *et al.*, 2012). Statistically significant differences in Sr/Ca ratios among taxa (Table 2) indicates that diagenesis has not obscured the original ecological signal. Sympatric suids, *Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii* ( $\bar{x}$ =0.54±0.38, n=4) and *Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus* ( $\bar{x}$ =1.22±0.19, n= 4), displayed the highest Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled fauna. The Sr/Ca ratios of the smaller tetraconodont suid *P. kretzoii* were higher than those

**TABLE 2.** Significant differences in Sr/Ca ratios among the sampled R. II ungulate species. Values shown with asterisks indicate significance for  $\alpha \leq 0.05$  using Fisher's least significant difference test

Taxon	P. kretzoii	P. palaeochoerus	L. aff. <i>pierensis</i>	Miotragocerus sp.	H. intrans	T. Iongirostris	M. flourensianus
P. kretzoii	-						
P. palaeochoerus	0.06						
L. aff. pierensis	0.00*	0.04*					
Miotragocerus sp.	0.00*	0.01*	0.32				
H. intrans	0.00*	0.03*	0.81	0.46			
T. longirostris	0.00*	0.03*	0.40	0.83	0.50		
M. flourensianus	0.00*	0.00*	0.00*	0.03*	0.01*	0.21	
D. naui	0.00*	0.00*	0.02*	0.11	0.03*	0.34	0.74

of the larger suine P. palaeochoerus, but not significantly different (p=0.06, Fisher's LSD). The cervid Lucentia aff. pierensis (x=0.92±0.27, n=9), bovid Miotragocerus sp. ( $\bar{x}=0.82\pm0.22$ , n=8), equid Hippotherium intrans  $(\bar{x}=0.89\pm0.23, n=8)$ , and gomphothere Tetralophodon longirostris (x=0.77±0.05, n=2), showed intermediate Sr/Ca ratios. Large-bodied ruminants L. aff. pierensis and Miotragocerus sp. yielded higher, but not significantly different (p=0.989, Fisher's LSD), Sr/Ca ratios than monogastric H. intrans and T. longirostris. The tragulid Dorcatherium naui (x=0.52±0.13, n=4) and moschid Micromeryx flourensianus (x=0.57±0.16, n=6) displayed the lowest Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled fauna. The Sr/Ca ratios of the small-bodied ruminant M. flourensianus were significantly lower than those of the large-bodied ruminant *Miotragocerus* sp. (p=0.03, Fisher's LSD).

#### DISCUSSION

We found significant differences in the Sr/Ca ratios of the R. II fauna indicative of differential dietary resource use (Fig. 2; Table 2). Taxonomic differences in Sr/Ca ratios are generally concordant with those previously inferred on the basis of enamel oxygen and carbon stable isotope ratios (Eastham *et al.*, 2016; Fig. 3 of this paper). Both the heterogeneous taxonomic correlations between the patterning of Sr/Ca and stable isotope ratios (Eastham *et al.*, 2016) indicate that original biogenic signals are reflected in the enamel. To stress, we are not arguing that the enamel of the R. II fauna has not undergone any *post mortem* alteration, but rather that the ecological patterning of concern to this study has not been obscured by diagenesis.

Plant roots, rhizomes, and stems preferentially accumulate heavier alkaline-earth elements resulting in higher Sr concentrations than leaves, flowers, and fruits (Runia, 1987; Sillen et al., 1995; Burton et al., 1999). Several authors have linked elevated Sr/Ca ratios in modern and fossil mammals with the consumption of Srrich underground plant parts (Sealy and Sillen, 1988; Sillen et al., 1995; Burton et al., 1999; Lee-Thorp et al., 2003; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006; Fourie et al., 2008). The suids showed the highest Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled fauna (Fig. 2) suggesting diets rich in roots and rhizomes, which would have been abundant in the soft substrates along the margin of Lake Pannon. This interpretation is concordant with the higher carbon and lower oxygen isotope values reported for the R. II suids (Eastham et al., 2016; Fig. 3). However, an omnivorous diet similar to that of the modern bush pig (Potamochoerus porcus) could also account for elevated Sr/Ca ratios (Balter et al., 2002; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Domingo et



FIGURE 2. Mean value ±1 standard deviation plots of Sr/Ca enamel ratios of the R. II ungulates. Mammal reconstructions are not to scale.

al., 2012). Patterns of molar emergence and wear indicate that the R. II suids had similar diets, with some degree of niche separation (Bernor et al., 2003). Bernor et al. (2003) suggested that the R. II locality was situated within the core habitat of the larger suine Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus and marginal to the preferred habitat of the smaller tetraconodont suid Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii. Stable isotope analysis also indicates differential dietary resource use, with *P. palaeochoerus* displaying significantly higher carbon isotope values than Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii (Eastham et al., 2016; Fig. 3). Sr/Ca ratios support the interpretation of niche separation with *P. kretzoii* ( $\bar{x}$ = 1.54±0.38) showing comparatively higher Sr/Ca ratios than *P. palaeochoerus* ( $\bar{x}$ = 1.22±0.19). While it is likely that both of the R. II suids were engaged in rooting the lower Sr/ Ca ratios of P. palaeochoerus could indicate an increased dependence on Sr-poor resources, such as fruit. The higher and more varied Sr/Ca ratios of P. kretzoii could suggest a more omnivorous diet and/or an increased dependence on underground plant parts. An omnivorous diet has been interpreted for the Middle Miocene tetraconodont suid Conohyus simorrensis (LARTET, 1851) on the basis of heterogeneous Sr/Ca ratios (Domingo et al., 2012).

The cervid *Lucentia* aff. *pierensis* ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.92±0.27) and equid *Hippotherium intrans* ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.89±0.23) share relatively higher Sr/Ca ratios, which could indicate

intermediate feeding including some intake of C<sub>3</sub> graminoids. Grazing herbivores have been shown to reflect higher Sr/Ca ratios than coexisting browsers (Sponheimer et al., 2005; Sponheimer and Lee-Thorp, 2006), as grasses are more enriched in Sr than dicotyledonous plants (Runia, 1987; Burton et al., 1999). A flexible feeding strategy that included the consumption of grasses, leaves, and possibly fruits has been interpreted for Late Miocene Hippotherium on the basis of stable isotope and meso- and microwear data (Merceron et al., 2007; Merceron, 2009; Tütken et al., 2013; Eastham et al., 2016). Meso- and microwear and stable isotope analysis of L. aff. pierensis also indicates intermediate feeding (Merceron et al., 2007; Eastham et al., 2016; Fig. 3). Domingo et al. (2009, 2012) analyzed the stable isotope, Sr/Ca, and barium/calcium (Ba/Ca) ratios of the Middle Miocene equid Anchitherium cf. A. cursor (SÁNCHEZ et al., 1998) from the Somosaguas site in Spain, and interpreted that equinid population as being intermediate feeding. Here, the Sr/Ca ratios of Anchitherium were higher than those of the coexisting gomphothere, but slightly lower than those of the largebodied ruminants (Domingo et al., 2012). At R. II, the Sr/Ca ratios of H. intrans are higher than those of the gomphothere Tetralophodon longirostris ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.77±0.05), and fall between those of the two large-bodied ruminants (L. aff. pierensis and Miotragocerus sp.).



**FIGURE 3**. Scatter plot of mean values and total ranges of enamel Sr/Ca ratios and carbon stable isotope ( $\delta^{13}$ C) values of the R. II fauna.  $\delta^{13}$ C enamel values are taken from Eastham *et al.*, 2016.

Unlike the cervid (Lucentia aff. piernesis) and equid (Hippotherium intrans), the elevated Sr/Ca ratios of the bovid Miotragocerus sp. are incongruent with morphological and stable isotope data, which suggest a diet dominated by leaves with a small fruit component (Solounias and Dawson-Saunders, 1988; Spassov and Geraads, 2004; Merceron et al., 2007; Merceron, 2009; Eastham et al., 2016). This type of diet would typically be associated with relatively low Sr/Ca ratios (Burton et al., 1999; Lee-Thorp et al., 2003; Sponheimer et al., 2005; Drouet and Herbauts, 2008). The discrepancy between morphological and trace element data could be accounted for by differences in the gastrointestinal tract of ruminant vs. monogastric ungulates. Balter et al. (2002) found that ruminants were enriched in Ba compared to contemporaneous monogastric mammoths, rhinoceroses, and equids. Barium is chemically very similar to strontium and shows a comparable metabolic behavior (Burton, 2008). In fact, several studies have shown that Ba/Ca and Sr/Ca ratios reflect similar dietary information (Burton and Wright, 1995; Burton et al., 1999; Burton, 2008). These authors suggest that the prolonged retention of digesta in ruminant bodies, in addition to more efficient cellulose digestion, results in a greater concentration of non-essential trace elements in the bones and teeth. Deer and antelope have been shown to yield significantly higher Ba/Ca ratios than other non-ruminant herbivores (Gilbert et al., 1994; Burton et al., 1999). Domingo et al. (2009, 2012) found the highest Sr/Ca and Ba/Ca ratios in the large-bodied ruminants at the Somosaguas site. At R. II, the Sr/Ca ratios of *Miotragocerus* sp. are higher than those of the gomphothere T. longirostris ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.77±0.05) and comparable with those of the cervid and equid. While limited by sample size (n= 2), the Sr/Ca ratios of T. longirostris are congruent with morphological and stable isotope data indicating a browsing diet (Agustí and Antón, 2002; Domingo et al., 2013; Eastham et al., 2016). It is likely that the comparatively higher Sr/Ca ratios of the bovid reflect a different digestive physiology (ruminant vs. monogastric) rather than a significant difference in diet.

Dorcatherium naui ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.52±0.13; Tragulidae) and Micromeryx ourensianus ( $\bar{x}$ = 0.57±0.16; Moschidae) displayed the lowest Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled fauna (Table 2; Fig. 2) indicating a preference for Sr-poor plants or plant parts. Trace element concentrations are unevenly distributed in plants, with the highest concentrations in the roots and lowest concentrations in the fruits (Rao, 1979; Runia, 1987; Burton *et al.*, 1999; Drouet and Herbauts, 2008). For example, an early study of chicku (Achras sapota) and mango (Mangifera indica) trees revealed lower Sr concentrations in fruits as compared to leaves (Rao, 1979). The low Sr/Ca ratios of D. naui and M. ourensianus are in accordance with morphological and stable isotope data indicating a dietary preference for fruit (Tütken *et al.*, 2006; Merceron *et al.*, 2007; Merceron, 2009; Aiglstorfer *et al.*, 2014; Eastham *et al.*, 2016; Fig 3.). The presence of species dependent on fruit is consistent with the abundance of endocarps recovered from R. II (Kordos and Begun, 2002; Hably and Erdei, 2013). *D. naui* and *M. flourensianus* are suggested to have occupied a similar niche to extant duikers (*Cephalophus* sp.; SMITH, 1827) and water chevrotains (*Hyemoschus aquaticus*; OGILBY, 1841), which inhabit the forest floors of tropical Africa and selectively feed on fruits and seeds fallen from the canopy (Nowak, 1991; Cerling *et al.*, 2004; Merceron *et al.*, 2007; 2009; Rössner, 2007; Alba *et al.*, 2011).

Interestingly, the Sr/Ca ratios of M. flourensianus were significantly lower (p= 0.03, Fisher's LSD) than those of the bovid Miotragocerus sp. (Fig. 2; Table 2). The results are unexpected given that both species were ruminants thought to have browsed on leaves and fruits (Tütken et al., 2006; Merceron et al., 2007; Merceron, 2009; Aiglstorfer et al., 2014; Eastham et al., 2016), which are Sr-poor plant resources. As far as we know, the behavior of Sr in the gastrointestinal tracts of small vs. large-bodied ruminants has not yet been studied, so no conclusive remarks can be made. However, it is possible that the unique digestive adaptations of extant small-bodied ruminant frugivores could help to clarify this finding. Rumination is a relatively inefficient way to obtain energy from low fiber foods, like most fruits (Cork, 1996). Despite this, many smallbodied ruminants living in tropical forests throughout the world depend on fruit for energy and nutrients. The success of small-bodied ruminant frugivores has been related to several adaptations in their digestive process. Their small rumen and fermentation capacity relative to energy requirements requires that they eat more readily fermentable carbohydrates and subsequently pass plant fiber more rapidly through the digestive tract (Demment and Van Soest, 1985). They also tend to have a larger reticuloomasal orifice, which allows some digesta to escape rumen fermentation (Hofmann, 1973). If the prolonged retention of digesta by large-bodied ruminants is associated with an increase in the uptake of non-essential trace elements, it seems plausible that the rapid passage of digesta by smallbodied ruminant frugivores could result in a decrease in trace element uptake. Testing this hypothesis, however, requires further baseline work with modern ruminants examining the behaviour of Sr under different digestive strategies.

Determining ecological relationships within trophic levels is important for understanding how ecosystems function. The niche partitioning hypothesis predicts that ecologically similar species can coexist by partitioning their resources in one or more of the three primary niche dimensions (diet, habitat and time; Hardin, 1960; Schoener, 1974; DiBitetti *et al.*, 2009), with diet being the most commonly segregated axis

among herbivores (Stewart et al., 2002). The trace element analysis shows significant differences in dietary resource use within the early Late Miocene ungulate community at R. II, implying that the different analyzed ungulate species did partition resources by selecting different plants and/or plant parts, which would diminish competition. However, the overlapping ranges of Sr/Ca values displayed by the two suids, the cervid and equid, and the tragulid and moschid indicate some degree of dietary niche overlap. Studies of modern herbivore communities have demonstrated increased dietary niche overlap during periods of resource abundance. The low levels of feeding competition that occur during these periods promote the coexistence of ecologically similar species (Pyke et al., 1977; Gordon and Illius, 1989; Stevenson et al., 2000; Levine and Hille Ris Lambers, 2009; Singh et al., 2011; Djagoun et al., 2013; Landman et al., 2013; Kartzinel et al., 2015). A local abundance of plant resources in addition to dietary resource partitioning likely acted as the primary factors promoting species coexistence within the ungulate community at R. II.

While the fossil record at R. II provides important information for understanding the factors that acted to promote the assembly and coexistence of early Vallesian mammalian communities, it lacks the depth of time required to evaluate changes in faunal diversity through time. Recent analysis of small mammal diversity in the Vallès-Penedès Basin in Spain indicates a slow decline in taxonomic richness occurring since the late Vallesian (Casanovas-Vilar et al., 2014, 2016). These findings are contrary to previous studies, which reported an abrupt extinction event at the early/late Vallesian boundary (the Vallesian Crisis; Agustí and Moyà-Solà, 1990; Agustí et al., 1997, 1999, 2003, 2013). Casanovas-Vilar et al. (2014, 2016) suggested that the decline of forest-dwelling taxa occurred gradually through a series of extinction events beginning in the late Vallesian. These authors asserted that the abrupt pattern of extinctions interpreted as the "Vallesian Crisis" resulted from uneven sampling. In central Europe, studies by Franzen et al. (2013) and Daxner-Höck et al. (2016) have demonstrated the persistence of some forest-adapted fauna (chalicotheres, moschids, and certain rodents) well into the early Turolian. Environmental changes associated with the Late Miocene cooling are not well expressed in the Pannonian Basin (Ivanov et al., 2011; Hably, 2013; Utescher et al., 2017), due to the buffering effect of Lake Pannon. A recent palaeoclimatic study utilizing Plant Functional Types (PFTs) indicated constantly humid conditions along the northern margin of the lake throughout the early and middle Turolian (9-6.5Ma; Utescher et al., 2017).

### CONCLUSIONS

Examination of tooth enamel Sr/Ca ratios in early Late Miocene ungulates from R. II showed significant

differences in dietary resource use. In general, the Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled species support previous ecological determinations made on the basis of morphological and stable isotope data. The suids Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii and Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus displayed the highest Sr/Ca ratios suggesting a preference for Sr-rich roots and rhizomes. Parachleuastochoerus kretzoii yielded higher and more heterogeneous Sr/Ca ratios than Propotamochoerus palaeochoerus, which could be indicative of a more omnivorous diet. Elevated Sr/Ca ratios exhibited by the cervid Lucentia aff. pierensis and equid Hippotherium intrans suggest intermediate feeding, which included the intake of C<sub>3</sub> graminoids. The bovid *Miotragocerus* sp. displayed higher Sr/Ca ratios, suggesting intermediate feeding, than the gomphothere *Tetralophodon longirostris*. The implication for Miotragocerus sp. as an intermediate feeder is incongruent with morphological and stable isotope data, which identifies it as a browser. This discrepancy likely reflects a difference in digestive physiology (ruminant vs. monogastric) as opposed to a difference in dietary behavior. The traguild Dorcatherium naui and moschid Micromeryx flourensianus showed the lowest Sr/Ca ratios of the sampled R. II fauna suggesting a preference for Sr-poor fruit. A similar range of Sr/Ca values were found in several of the sampled species implying some degree of interspecific competition. To diminish potential competition it is likely that the different ungulate species partitioned plant resources within the local environment, which would have acted to promote coexistence within this diverse community of predominantly browsing herbivores. This study further highlights the utility of trace element ratios to discern the complex ecological relationships of species in ancient ecosystems.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Funding and/or logistical support was provided by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) (RGPIN-2016-06761), the National Geographic Society (8801-10), Ontario Graduate Scholarship, Geological Society of America Research Award, General Motors Women in Science and Mathematics Award, University of Toronto Graduate Fellowship, and the New York State Museum. We thank the Geological and Geophysical Institute of Hungary (MFGI). We thank L. Kordos, J. Halfar, D. Bovee and D. Boutilier for their contributions to this research.

#### REFERENCES

- Agustí, J., Moyà-Solà, S., 1990. Mammal extinctions in the Vallesian (Upper Miocene). Lecture Notes in Earth Sciences, 30, 425-432.
- Agustí, J., Antón, M., 2002. Mammoths, Sabertooths, and Hominids: 65 Million Years of Mammalian Evolution in Europe. New York, Columbia University Press, 313pp.

- Agustí, J., Cabrera, L., Garcés, M., Parés, J.M., 1997. The Vallesian mammal succession in the Vallès-Penedès basin (Northeast Spain): paleomagnetic calibration and correlation with global events. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 133, 149-180.
- Agustí, J., Cabrera, L., Garcés, M., Llenas, M., 1999. Mammal turnover and Global climate change in the Late Miocene terrestrial record of the Vallès-Penedès Basin (NE Spain). In: Agustí, J., Rook, L., Andrews, P. (eds.). Hominoid Evolution and Climatic Change in Europe. Vol. 1: The Evolution of Neogene Terrestrial Ecosystems in Europe. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 390-397.
- Agustí, J., Siria, A.S.D., Garcés, M., 2003. Explaining the end of the hominoid experiment in Europe. Journal of Human Evolution, 45, 145-153.
- Agustí, J., Cabrera, L., Garcés, M., 2013. The Vallesian mammal turnover: A Late Miocene record of decoupled land-ocean evolution. Geobios, 46, 151-157.
- Aiglstorfer, M., Bocherens, H., Böhme, M., 2014. Large Mammal Ecology in the late Middle Miocene locality Gratkorn (Austria). Palaeobiodiversity and Palaeoenvironments, 94, 189-213.
- Alba, D.M., Moyà-Solà, S., Robles, J.M., Casanovas-Vilar, I., Rotgers, C., Carmona, R., Galindo, J., 2011. Middle Miocene tragulid remains from Abocador de Can Mata: the earliest record of *Dorcatherium naui* fromWestern Europe. Geobios, 44, 135-150.
- Andrews, P., Cameron, D., 2010. Rudabànya: Taphonomic analysis of a fossil hominid site from Hungary. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 297, 311-329.
- Andrews, P., Harrison, T., Martin, L., Delson, E., Bernor, R.L., 1996. Systematics and biochronology of European Neogene catarrhines. In: Bernor, R., Fahlbusch, V. (eds.). Evolution of Neogene Continental Biotopes in Europe and the Eastern Mediterranean. New York, Columbia University Press, 168-207.
- Armour-Chelu, M., Andrews, P., Bernor, R.L., 2005. Further observations on the primate community at Rudabánya II (Late Miocene, early Vallesian age), Hungary. Journal of Human Evolution, 49, 88-98.
- Avioli, L.V., 1988. Calcium and phosphorus. In: Shils, M.E., Young, V.R. (eds.). Modern Nutrition in Health and Disease. Philadelphia, Lea and Febiger, 142-148.
- Balter, V., 2004. Allometric constraints on Sr/Ca and Ba/ Ca partitioning in terrestrial mammalian trophic chains. Oecologia, 139, 83-88.
- Balter, V., Bocherens, H., Person, A., Labourdette, N., Renard, M., Vandermeersch, B., 2002. Ecological and physiological variability of Sr/Ca and Ba/Ca in mammals of West European mid-Würmian food webs. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 186, 127-143.
- Balter, V., Braga, J., Telouk, P., Thackeray, F., 2012. Evidence for dietary change but not landscape use in South African early hominins. Nature, 489, 558-560.
- Begun, D.R., 2007. Fossil record of Miocene hominoids. In: Henke, W., Tattersall, I. (eds.). Handbook of Paleoanthropology. Heidelberg, Springer, 921-977.

- Bernor, R.L., Armour-Chelu, M., Kaiser, T.M., Scott, R.S., 2003. An evaluation of the late MN 9 (Late Miocene, Vallesian age), hipparion assemblage from Rudabánya (Hungary): Systematic background, functional anatomy and paleoecology. Coloquios de Paleontología, Volumen Extraordinario, 1, 35-45.
- Bernor, R.L., Kordos, L., Rook, L., Agustí, J., Andrews, P., Armour-Chelu, M., Begun, D.R., de Bonis, L., Cameron, D.W., Damuth, J., Daxner-Höck, G., Fessaha, N., Fortelius, M., Franzen, J.L., Gasparik, M., Gentry, A., Heissig, K., Hernyak, G., Kaiser, T.M., Koufos, G.D., Krolopp, E., Jánossy, D., Llenas, M., Meszáros, L., Müller, P., Renne, P.R., Rocek, Z., Sen, S., Scott, R.S., Szindlar, Z., Topál, G.Y., Ungar, P.S., Untescher, T., van Dam, J.A., Werdelin, L., Ziegler, R., 2004. Recent advances on multidisciplinary research at Rudabánya, Late Miocene (MN9), Hungary: a compendium. Paleontographica Italia, 89, 3-36.
- Blum, J.D., Taliaferro, H., Weisse, M.T., Holmes, R.T., 2000. Changes in Sr/Ca, Ba/Ca and <sup>87</sup>Sr/<sup>86</sup>Sr ratios between trophic levels in two forest ecosystems in the northeastern USA. Biogeochemistry, 49, 87-101.
- Bowen, H.J.M., Dymond, J.A., 1955. Strontium and barium in plants and soils. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, 144(B), 355-368.
- Brügmann, G., Krause, J. Brachert, T.C., Stoll, B., Weis, U., Kullmer, O., Semmanda, I., Mertz, D.F., 2012. Chemical composition of modern and fossil hippopotamid teeth and implications for paleoenvironmental reconstructions and enamel formation – Part 2: Alkaline earth elements as tracers of watershed hydrochemistry and provenance. Biogeosciences, 9, 4803-4817.
- Burton, J.H., 2008. Bone chemistry and trace element analysis. In: Katzenberg, A.M., Saunders, S.R., (eds.). Biological Anthropology of the Human Skeleton. New Jersey, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Second Edition, 443-460.
- Burton, J.H., Wright, L.E., 1995. Nonlinearity in the relationship between bone Sr/Ca and diet: paleodietary implications. American Journal of Physical Anthropology, 96, 273-282.
- Burton, J.H., Price, T.D., 2002. The use and abuse of trace elements for paleodietary research. In: Ambrose, S.H., Katzenberg, M.A. (eds.). Biogeochemical Approaches to Paleodietary Analysis, Advances in Archaeological and Museum Science. Springer, 159-171.
- Burton, J.H., Price, T.D., Middleton, W.D., 1999. Correlation of bone Ba/Ca and Sr/Ca due to biological purification of calcium. Journal of Archaeological Science, 26, 609-616.
- Casanovas-Vilar, I., Alba, D.M., Garcés, M., Robles, J.M., Moyá-Solá, S., 2011. Updated chronology for the Miocene hominoid radiation in western Eurasia. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 108, 5554-5559.
- Casanovas-Vilar, I., Van den Hoek Ostende, L.W., Furió, M., Madern, P.A., 2014. The range and extent of the Vallesian Crisis (Late Miocene): new prospects based on the micromammal record from the Vallès-Penedès basin (Catalonia, Spain). Journal of Iberian Geology, 40, 29-48.

- Casanovas-Vilar, I., Madern, A., Alba, D., Cabrera, L., García-Paredes, I., van den Hoek Ostende, L., DeMiguel, D., Robles, J.M., Furió, M., van Dam, J., Garcés, M., Angelone, C., Moyà-Solà, S., 2016. The Miocene mammal record of the Vallès-Penedès Basin (Catalonia). Comptes Rendus Palevol, 15, 791-812.
- Cerling, T.E., Hart, J.A., Hart, T.B., 2004. Stable isotope ecology in the Ituri forest. Oecologia, 138, 5-12.
- Chattopadhyay, N., Quinn, S.J., Kifor, O., Ye, C., Brown, E.M., 2007. The calcium-sensing receptor (CaR) is involved in strontium ranelate-induced osteoblast proliferation. Biochemical Pharmacology, 74, 438-447.
- Cork, S., 1996. Optimal digestive strategies for arboreal herbivorous mammals in contrasting 354 forest types: why koalas and colobines are different. Australian Journal of Ecology, 21, 10-20.
- Daxner-Höck, G., 2004. Biber und ein zwerghamster aus Mataschen (unter-pannonium, steirisches becken). Joannea Geologie und Paläontologie, 5, 19-33.
- Daxner-Höck, G., Harzhauser, M., Göhlich, U., 2016. Fossil record and dynamics of the Late Miocene small mammal faunas of the Vienna Basin and adjacent basins. Austria. Comptes Rendus Palevol, 15, 855-862.
- Demment, M.W., Van Soest, P.J., 1985. A nutritional explanation for body-size patterns of ruminant and nonruminant herbivores. American Naturalist, 125, 641-672.
- DiBitetti, M.S., Di Blanco, Y.E., Pereira, J.A., Paviolo, A., Jiménez Pérez, I., 2009. Time partitioning favors the coexistence of sympatric crab-eating foxes (*Cerdocyon thous*) and pampas foxes (*Lycalopex gymnocercus*). Journal of Mammalogy, 90, 479-490.
- Djagoun, C., Kassa, B., Mensah, G., Sinsin, B., 2013. Seasonal habitat and diet partitioning between two sympatric bovid species in Pendjari Biosphere Reserve (northern Benin): waterbuck and western kob. African Zoology, 48, 279-289.
- Domingo, L., Cuevas-González, J., Grimes, S.T., Hernández Fernández, M., López-Martínez, N., 2009. Multiproxy reconstruction of the palaeoclimate and palaeoenvironment of the Middle Miocene Somosaguas site (Madrid, Spain) using herbivore dental enamel. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 272, 53-68.
- Domingo, L., López-Martínez, N., Grimes, S.T., 2012. Trace element analyses indicative of paleodiets in Middle Miocene Mammals from the Somosaguas site (Madrid, Spain). Geologica Acta, 10(3), 239-247.
- Domingo, M.S., Domingo, L., Badgley, C., Sanisidro, O., Morales, J., 2013. Resource partitioning among top predators in a Miocene food web. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London, B: Biological Sciences, 280 (1750), 9pp. DOI:10.1098/rsbp.2012.2138.
- Drouet, T., Herbauts, J., 2008. Evaluation of the mobility and discrimination of Ca, Sr and Ba in forest ecosystems: consequence on the use of alkaline-earth element ratios as tracers of Ca. Plant Soil, 302, 105-124.

- Eastham, L., Feranec, R.S., Begun, D.R., Kordos, L., 2011. Resource partitioning in Late Miocene Central European Mammals: Isotopic evidence from the Rudabánya fauna. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology, 31 (Supplement 2), 103.
- Eastham, L., Feranec, R.S., Begun, D.R., 2016. Stable isotopes show resource partitioning among the early Late Miocene herbivore community at Rudabánya II: Palaeoenvironmental implications for the hominoid, *Rudapithecus hungaricus*. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 454, 161-174.
- Eberle, J., Sponheimer, M., Marchitto, T., 2009. Biogenic patterning of Sr and Ba in Early Oligocene (Orellan) mammalian tooth enamel. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology, 29, 91A.
- Elias, R.W., Hirao, Y., Patterson, C.C., 1982. The circumvention of the natural biopurification of calcium along nutrient pathways by atmospheric inputs of industrial lead. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 46, 2561-2580.
- Erdei, B., Hably, L., Kázmér, M., Utescher, T., Bruch, A., 2007. Neogene flora and vegetation development of the Pannonian domain in relation to palaeoclimate and palaeogeography. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 253, 131-156.
- Fortelius, M., Hokkanen, A., 2001. The trophic context of hominoid occurrence in the later Miocene of western Eurasia—a primate-free view. In: de Bonis, L., Koufos, G., Andrews, A., (eds.). Phylogeny of the Neogene Hominoid Primates of Eurasia. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 19-47.
- Fortelius, M., Werdelin, L., Andrews, P., Bernor, R.L., Gentry, A., Humphrey, L., Mittmann, H.-W., Viranta, S., 1996. Provinciality, diversity, turnover and palaeoecology in land mammal faunas of the Late Miocene of Western Eurasia. In: Bernor, R.L., Fahlbusch, V., Mittmann, H.-W. (eds.). The evolution of Western Eurasian Neogene mammal faunas. Columbia University Press, New York, 414-448.
- Fortelius, M., Eronen, J., Jernvall, J., Liu, L., Pushkina, D., Rinne, J., 2002. Fossil mammals resolve regional patterns of Eurasian climate change over 20 million years. Evolutionary Ecology Research, 4, 1005-1016.
- Fortelius, M., Armour-Chelu, M., Bernor, R.L., Fessaha, N., 2005. Systematics and palaeobiology of the Rudabánya Suidae. Palaeontographica Italica, 90, 259-278.
- Fourie, N.H., Lee-Thorp, J.A., Rogers-Ackermann, R., 2008. Biogeochemical and craniometric investigation of dietary ecology, niche separation, and taxonomy of Plio-Pleistocene Cercopithecoids from the Makapansgat Limeworks. American Journal of Physical Anthropology, 135, 121-135.
- Franzen, J.L., Storch, G., 1999. Late Miocene mammals from central Europe. Hominoid Evolution and Climatic Change in Europe. In: Agustí, J.L., Rook, L., Andrews, P. (eds). The evolution of Neogene terrestrial ecosystems in Europe. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 165-190.
- Franzen, J.L., Pickford, M., Costeur, L., 2013. Palaeobiodiversity, palaeoecology, palaeobiogeography and biochronology

of Dorn-Dürkheim 1 - a summary. Palaeodiversity and Palaeoenvironments, 93, 277-284.

- Gilbert, C., Sealy, J., Sillen, A., 1994. An investigation of barium, calcium and strontium as palaeodietary indicators in the Southwestern Cape, South Africa. Journal of Archaeological Science, 21, 173-184.
- Gordon, I.J., Illius, A.W., 1989. Resource partitioning by ungulates on the Isle of Rhum. Oecologia, 79, 383-389.
- Hably, L., 2013. The Late Miocene flora of Hungary. Geolologica Hungarica Series Palaeontologica, 56, 1-173.
- Hably, L., Erdei, B., 2013. A refugium of mastixia in the Late Miocene of eastern central Europe. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology, 197, 218-225.
- Hardin, G., 1960. The competitive exclusion principle. Science, 131, 1292-1297.
- Harrison, T., 2002. Late Oligocene to middle Miocene catarrhines from Afro–Arabia. In: Hartwig, W. (ed.). The Primate Fossil Record. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 311-338.
- Harzhauser, M., Mandic, O., 2004. The muddy bottom of Lake Pannon - A challenge for dreissenid settlement (Late Miocene; bivalvia). Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 204, 331-352.
- Harzhauser, M., Latal, C., Piller, W.E., 2007. The stable isotope archive of Lake Pannon as a mirror of Late Miocene climate change. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 249, 335-350.
- Harzhauser, M., Kern, A., Soliman, A., Minati, K., Piller, W.E., Danielopol, D.L., 2008. Centennial- to decadal scale environmental shifts in and around Lake Pannon (Vienna Basin) related to a major Late Miocene lake level rise. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 270, 102-115.
- Herwartz, D., Tütken, T., Jochum, K.P., Sander, P.M., 2013. Rare earth element systematics of fossil bone revealed by LA-ICPMS analysis. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 103, 161-183.
- Hillson, S., 2005. Teeth, Cambridge Manuals in Archaeology (2nd edition). Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 373pp.
- Hofmann, R.R., 1973. The ruminant stomach. Nairobi, East African Literature Bureau, 342-349.
- Ivanov, D., Utescher, T., Mosbrugger, V., Syabryaj, S., Dordjevic-Milutinovic, D., Molchanoff, S., 2011. Miocene vegetation and climate dynamics in Eastern and Central Paratethys (Southeastern Europe). Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 304, 262-275.
- Kartzinel, T., Chen, P., Coverdale, T., Erickson, D., Kress, J., Kuzmina, M., Rubenstein, D., Wang, W., Pringle, R., 2015. DNA metabarcoding illuminates dietary niche partitioning by African large herbivores. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 112, 8019-8024.
- Kaup, J.J., 1832. Description d'ossements fossiles de mammifères inconnus jusqu'à présent qui se trouvent au Muséum grand ducal de Darmstadt. Darmstadt, Meyer, 1-119.
- Kaup, J.J., 1833. Description d'Ossements fossiles de Mammifères inconnus jusqu'à présent. Qui se trouvent au Muséum grandducal de Darmstadt, 1-64.

- Kaup, J.J., Scholl, J.B., 1834. Verzeichniss der Gypsabgüsse von den ausgezeichnetsten urweltlichen. Thierresten des Grossherzoglichen Museum zu Darmstadt, 6-28.
- Kázmér, M., 1990. Birth, life and death of the Pannonian Lake. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 79, 171-188
- Koch, P.L., Tuross, N., Fogel, M.L., 1997. The effects of sample treatment and diagenesis on the isotopic integrity of carbonate in biogenic hydroxylapatite. Journal of Archaeological Science, 24, 417-429.
- Kohn, M.J., Moses, R.J., 2013. Trace element diffusivities in bone rule out simple diffusive uptake during fossilization but explain in vivo uptake and release. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 110, 419-424.
- Kohn, M.J., Schoeninger, M.J., Barker, W.W., 1999. Altered states: effects of diagenesis on fossil tooth chemistry. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 63, 2737-2747.
- Kohn, M.J., Morris, J., Olin, P., 2013. Trace element concentrations in teeth – a modern Idaho baseline with implications for archeometry, forensics, and paleontology. Journal of Archaeological Science, 40, 1689-1699.
- Kordos, L., 1991. Le *Rudapithecus hungaricus* de Rudabànya (Hongrie). L'Anthropologie, 95, 343-362.
- Kordos, L., Begun, D.R., 2002. Rudabánya: A Late Miocene subtropical swamp deposit with evidence of the origin of the African apes and humans. Evolutionary Anthropology, 11, 45-57.
- Kretzoi, M., 1969. Geschichte der Primaten und der Hominisation. Symposia Biologica Hungarica, 9, 3-11.
- Kretzoi, M., 1975. New ramapithecines and *Pliopithecus* from the lower Pliocene of Rudabánya in north-eastern Hungary. Nature, 257, 578-581.
- Kretzoi, M., 1983. Gerinces Indexfajok Felsö-neozói rétegtanunkban Hipparion. Magyr Állami Földtani Intézet Évi Jelentése AZ. Évröl, 513-521.
- Kretzoi, M., Krolopp, E., Lörincz, H., Pálfalvy, I., 1976. A Rudabanyai also pannonai prehominidas lelohely floraja, faunaja es retegtani helyzete. Annual Report of the Hungarian Geological Institute, 365-394.
- Kyle, J.H., 1986. Effect of post-burial contamination on the concentrations of major and minor elements in human bones and teeth: the implications for palaeodietary research. Journal of Archaeological Science, 13, 403-416.
- Landman, M., Schoeman, D., Kerley, G., 2013. Shift in the black rhinoceros diet in the presence of the elephant: evidence for competition? PLoS ONE, 8(7), e69771.
- Lartet, É., 1851. Notice sur la colline de Sansan. Suivie d'une récapitulation de diverses espèces d'animaux vértébres fossiles trouves soit à Sansan, soit dans d'autres gisements du terrain tertiaire miocène dans le bassin sous-pyrénéen. Auch (Portes), 1-45.
- Lee-Thorp, J.A., Van der Merwe, N.J., 1987. Carbon isotope analysis of fossil bone apatite. South African Journal of Science, 83, 712-715.

- Lee-Thorp, J.A., Van der Merwe, N.J., 1991. Aspects of the chemistry of modern and fossil biological apatites. Journal of Archaeological Science, 18, 343-354.
- Lee-Thorp, J.A., Sponheimer, M., van der Merwe, N.J., 2003. What do stable isotopes tell us about hominid dietary and ecological niches in the Pliocene? International Journal of Osteoarchaeology, 13, 104-113.
- Lengemann, F.W., 1963. Over-all Aspects of Calcium and Strontium Absorption, the Transfer of Calcium and Strontium across Biological Membranes. New York, Academic Press, 85pp.
- Levine, J.M., Hille Ris Lambers, J., 2009. The importance of niches for maintenance of species diversity. Nature, 461, 254-257.
- Linnaeus, C., 1758. Systema Naturae, regnum animale, ed. X. (Systema naturae per regna tria naturae, secundum classes, ordines, genera, species, cum characteribus, differentiis, synonymis, locis. Tomus I. Editio decima, reformata.). London, British Museum, 853pp.
- Magyar, I., Geary, D.H., Müller, P., 1999. Paleogeographic evolution of the Late Miocene Lake Pannon in central Europe. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 147, 151-167.
- Martin, J.E., Vance, D., Balter, V., 2015. Magnesium stable isotope ecology using mammal tooth enamel. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 112, 430 -435.
- Merceron, G., 2009. The early Valleisan vertebrates of Atzelsdorf (Late Miocene, Austria). Annals of the Natural History Museum Vienna, 111A, 647-660.
- Merceron, G., Schulz, E., Kordos, L., Kaiser, T.M., 2007. Paleoenvironment of *Dryopithecus brancoi* at Rudabánya, Hungary: Evidence from dental meso- and micro-wear analyses of large vegetarian mammals. Journal of Human Evolution, 53, 331-349.
- Nowak, R.M. 1991. Walker's Mammals of the World (Fifth Edition). Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1081-1084.
- Ogilby, C., 1840. *Hyemoschus aquaticus*. Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London, 1-35.
- Palmqvist, P., Gröcke, D.R., Arribas, A., Fariña, R.A., 2003. Paleoecological reconstruction of a lower Pleistocene large mammal community using biogeochemical (δ<sup>13</sup>C, δ<sup>15</sup>N, δ<sup>18</sup>O, Sr:Zn) and ecomorphological approaches. Paleobiology, 29, 205-229.
- Peek, S., Clementz, M.T., 2012. Sr/Ca and Ba/Ca variations in environmental and biological sources: A survey of marine and terrestrial systems. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 95, 36-52.
- Pilgrim, G.E., 1926. The Fossil Suidae of India. Memoirs of the Geological Survey of India. Palaeontologia Indica, 8, 1-65.
- Popov, S.V., Rögl, F., Rozanov, A.Y., Steininger, F.F., Shcherba, I.G., Kováè, M., 2004. Lithological–paleogeographic maps of Paratethys. 10 maps Late Eocene to Pliocene. Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg, 250, 1-46.
- Price, T.D., Blitz, J., Burton, J., Ezzo, J.A., 1992. Diagenesis in prehistoric bone: problems and solutions. Journal of Archaeological Science, 19, 513-529.

- Pyke, G.H., Pulliam, H.R., Charnov, E.L., 1977. Optimal foraging: a selective review of theory and tests. Quarterly Review of Biology, 52, 137-157.
- Qu, Y., Jin, C., Zhang, Y., Hu, Y., Shang, X., Wang, C., 2013. Distribution patterns of elements in dental enamel of *G. blacki*: a preliminary dietary investigation using SRXRF. Applied Physics A, Materials Science & Processing, 111(1), 75-82.
- Rao, S.R., 1979. Elemental concentration in fruit and leaves of chicku and mango under natural environmental conditions. Proceedings of the Indian Academy of Science, 88, 175-182.
- Rögl, V.F., 1998. Palaeogeographic considerations for Mediterranean and Paratethys seaways (Oligocene to Miocene). Annals of the Natural History Museum Vienna, 99A, 279-310.
- Rossipal, E., Krachler, M., Li, F., Turk Micetic, D., 2000. Investigation of the transport of trace elements across barriers in humans: studies of placental and mammary transfer. Acta Paediatrica, 89, 1190-1195.
- Rössner, G.E., 2007. Family tragulidae. In: Prothero, D.R., Foss, S.E. (eds.). The Evolution of Artiodactyls. Johns Hopkins University Press (Baltimore), 213-220.
- Runia, L.T., 1987. Strontium and calcium distribution in plants: Effect on palaeodietary studies. Journal of Archaeological Science, 14, 599-608.
- Sánchez, I.M., Salesa, M.J., Morales, J., 1998. Revisión sistemática del género Anchitherium Meyer 1834 (Equidae; perissodactyla) en España. Estudios Geológicos, 54, 39-63.
- Sasaki, T., Garant, P., 1986. Ultracytochemical demonstration of ATP-dependent calcium pump in ameloblasts of rat incisor enamel organ. Calcified Tissue International, 39, 86-96.
- Schoener, T.W., 1974. Resource partitioning in ecological communities. Science, 185, 27-39.
- Scott, R.S., Amour-Chelu, M., Bernor, R.L., 2005. Hipparionine horses of the greater Pannonian Basin: morphometric evidence from the postcranial skeleton. Paleontographia Italica, 90, 193-212.
- Sealy, J.C., Sillen, A., 1988. Sr and Sr/Ca in marine and terrestrial foodwebs in the Southwestern Cape, South Africa. Journal of Archaeological Science, 15, 425-438.
- Ségalen, L., de Rafélis, M., Lee-Thorp, J.A., Maurer, A.-F., Renard, M., 2008. Cathodoluminescence tools provide clues to depositional history in Miocene and Pliocene mammalian teeth. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 266, 246-253.
- Sillen, A., 1986. Biogenic and diagenetic Sr/Ca in Plio-Pleistocene fossils of the Omo Shungura Formation. Paleobiology, 12, 311-323.
- Sillen, A., 1992. Strontium-calcium ratios (Sr/Ca) of *Australopithecus robustus* and associated fauna from Swartkrans. Journal of Human Evolution, 23, 495-516.
- Sillen, A., Kavanagh, M., 1982. Strontium and paleodietary research: A review. Yearbook of Physical Anthropology, 25, 67-90.
- Sillen, A., Hall, G., Armstrong, R., 1995. Strontium calcium ratios (Sr/Ca) and strontium isotopic ratios (<sup>87</sup>Sr/<sup>86</sup>Sr) of

*Australopithecus robustus* and *Homo* sp. from Swartkrans. Journal of Human Evolution, 28, 277-285.

- Singh, M., Roy, K., Singh, M., 2011. Resource partitioning in sympatric langurs and macaques in tropical rainforests of the western Ghats, South India. American Journal of Primatology, 73, 355-346.
- Smith, H., 1827. Griffith's Cuvier, Animal Kingdom. London, George Whittaker, 1-344.
- Solounias, N., Dawson-Saunders, B., 1988. Dietary adaptations and palaeoecology of the Late Miocene ruminants from Pikermi and Samos in Greece. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecolology, 65, 149-172.
- Spassov, N., Geraads, D., 2004. *Tragoportax pilgrim*, 1937 and *Miotragocerus stromer*, 1928 (Mammalia, Bovidae) from the Turolian of Hadjidimovo, Bulgaria, and a revision of the Late Miocene Mediterranean boselaphini. Geodiversitas, 26, 339-370.
- Sponheimer, M., Lee-Thorp, J.A., 1999. Alteration of enamel carbonate environments during fossilization. Journal of Archaeological Science, 26, 143-150.
- Sponheimer, M., Lee-Thorp, J.A., 2006. Enamel diagenesis at South African Australopith sites: Implications for paleoecological reconstruction with trace elements. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 70, 1644-1654.
- Sponheimer, M., de Ruiter, D., Lee-Thorp, J., Spath, A., 2005. Sr/ Ca and early hominin diets revisited: new data from modern and fossil tooth enamel. Journal of Human Evolution, 48, 147-156.
- Stevenson, P.R., Quinone, M.J., Ahumada, J.A., 2000. Influence of fruit availability on ecological overlap among four Neotropical primates at Tinigua National Park, Colombia. Biotropica, 32, 533-544.
- Stewart, K.M., Bowyer, R.T., Kie, J.G., Cimon, N.J., Johnson, B.K., 2002. Temporospatial distributions of elk, mule, deer, and cattle: resource partitioning and competitive displacement. Journal of Mammalogy, 83, 229-244.
- Stromer, E., 1928. Wirbeltiere im obermiozänen Flinz Münchens. Abhandlungen der Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, mathematisch-naturwissenschaftliche Klasse, 32, 1-71.
- Taylor, D., Bligh, P., Duggan, M.H., 1962. The absorption of calcium, strontium, barium and radium from the gastrointestinal tract of the rat. Biochemical Journal, 83, 25-29.
- Thomas, J.M., 1951. *Eostyloceros pierensis* nov. sp., nouveau cervuline du Pontien européen. Compte rendu sommaire desséances de la Société géologique de France, 6, 255-257.

- Trueman, C.N., Benton, M.J., 1997. A geochemical method to trace the taphonomic history of reworked bones in sedimentary settings. Geology, 25, 263-266.
- Trueman, C.N., Tuross, N., 2002. Trace elements in recent and fossil bone apatite. Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry, 48, 489-521.
- Tütken, T., Vennemann, T.W., Janz, H., Heizmann, E.P.J., 2006. Palaeoenvironment and palaeoclimate of the Middle Miocene lake in the Steinheim Basin, SW Germany: A reconstruction from C, O, and Sr isotopes of fossil remains. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 241, 457-491.
- Tütken, T., Vennemann, T.W., Pfretzschner, H.U., 2008. Early diagenesis of bone and tooth apatite in fluvial and marine settings: Constraints from combined oxygen isotope, nitrogen and REE analysis. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 266, 254-268.
- Tütken, T., Vennemann, T.W., Pfretzschner, H.-U., 2011. Nd and Sr isotope compositions in modern and fossil bones: Proxies for vertebrate provenance and taphonomy. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta, 75, 5951-5970.
- Tütken, T., Kaiser, T.M., Vennemann, T., Merceron, G., 2013. Opportunistic feeding strategy for the earliest hypsodont equids: Evidence from stable isotopes and dental wear proxies. PLoS ONE, 8(9), E74463.
- Underwood, E.J., 1977. Trace Elements in Human and Animal Nutrition. New York, Academic Press Inc., Fourth edition, 545pp.
- Utescher, T., Erdei, B., Hably, L., Mosbrugger, V., 2017. Late Miocene vegetation of the Pannonian Basin. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 467, 131-148.
- Walser, M., Robinson, B.H.B., 1963. Renal Excretion and Tubular Reabsorption of Calcium and Strontium, Transfer of Calcium and Strontium across Biological Membranes. New York, Academic Press, 326pp.
- Wang, Y., Cerling, T.E., 1994. A model of fossil tooth and bone diagenesis: implications for paleodiet reconstruction from stable isotopes. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 107, 281-289.
- Wang, K.M., 1929. Die fossilen Rhinocerotiden des Wiener Beckens. Shanghai, Memoirs of the Institute of Geology, 7, 53-59.
- de Winter, N.J., Snoeck, C., Claeys, P., 2016. Seasonal cyclicity in trace elements and stable isotopes of modern horse enamel. PLoS ONE, 11, E0166678.

Manuscript received October 2016; revision accepted May 2017; published Online July 2017.

# **APPENDIX I**

TABLE I. Sr/Ca ratios of the ungulate dental enamel samples from R. II

Specimen No.	Species	Family	Tooth position	Sr/Ca x 1000
RUD1026	P. kretozii	Suidae	M2	1.25
RUD1673	P. kretozii	Suidae	M3	1.31
RUD668	P. kretozii	Suidae	p4	1.52
RUD543	P. kretozii	Suidae	P3	2.08
RUD1355	P. palaeochoerus	Suidae	M2	1.42
RUD1021	P. palaeochoerus	Suidae	M3	1.19
RUD1331	P. palaeochoerus	Suidae	P3	1.28
RUD1343	P. palaeochoerus	Suidae	M1	0.98
RUD1851	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	P3	1.26
RUD279	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	m2	1.15
RUD486	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	m3	0.67
RUD1547	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	M1	0.7
RUD695	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	m2	0.71
RUD579	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	m1	1.21
RUD1513	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	M3	0.6
RUD1011	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	M2	1.17
RUD154	L. aff. pierensis	Cervidae	M2	0.8
RUD1611	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	m2	0.77
RUD1530	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	M3	0.68
RUD167	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	M1	0.6
RUD176	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	M2	0.58
RUD377	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	m3	1.13
RUD391	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	m2	0.69
RUD699	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	M3	1.2
RUD693	Miotragocerus sp.	Bovidae	m1	0.88
RUD1014	H. intrans	Equidae	m3	0.63
RUD804	H. intrans	Equidae	M2	0.62
RUD794	H. intrans	Equidae	m2	1.03
RUD139	H. intrans	Equidae	M3	0.84
RUD429	H. intrans	Equidae	m3	0.7
RUD628	H. intrans	Equidae	m2	0.94
RUD721	H. intrans	Equidae	M3	1.21
RUD728	H. intrans	Equidae	M3	1.06
MAFI6	T. longirostris	Gomphotheriidae	M3	0.73
MAFI7	T. longirostris	Gomphotheriidae	m2	0.8
RUD181	D. naui	Tragulidae	p2	0.45
RUD1133	D. naui	Tragulidae	M3	0.38
RUD1624	D. naui	Tragulidae	m2	0.64
RUD1691	D. naui	Tragulidae	M2	0.31
RUD130	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	m2	0.73
RUD1844	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	M3	0.58
RUD692	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	M2	0.46
RUD1613	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	P3	0.7
RUD1760	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	m2	0.67
RUD563	M. flourensianus	Moschidae	M3	0.48