

An Ecofeminist Review of Alternative Tourism Research in the Global South

Fiorila Hell

University for Peace (UPEACE), Costa Rica

Olivia Sylvester

University for Peace (UPEACE), Costa Rica

Submitted: 29th May 2023; Re-submitted: 9th July 2023; Accepted: 25th July 2023

e-ISSN: 2014-4458

Abstract

Alternative tourism emerged as a solution to the negative environmental and social impacts of mass tourism. Authors have scrutinised this practice to ensure it fulfils its promises of conservation and respects host cultures; however, we lack data on how alternative tourism affects women in the Global South and specifically we are lacking critical qualitative research on this topic. To better understand the state of knowledge on this topic, we reviewed 15 studies on alternative tourism in the Global South using an ecofeminist framework. Our research illustrates the following themes in the published literature: 1) tourism can reinforce gendered (and racial) stereotypes and roles, 2) there is an uneven gendered division of labour in tourism, 3) women have less access to education as compared with men and this precludes women occupying leadership positions in tourism, 4) even when women work in tourism, they lack protection regarding personal security, 5) women carry a time burden (due in part to a disproportionate responsibility for natural resources management) that limits their ability to be involved in tourism, 6) tourism can reinforce negative colonial relationships that affect people differently, 7) alternative tourism

Resumen

El turismo alternativo surgió como solución a las repercusiones medioambientales y sociales negativas del turismo de masas. Autores y autoras han examinado esta práctica para asegurarse de que cumple sus promesas de conservación y respeta las culturas anfitrionas; sin embargo, carecemos de datos sobre cómo afecta el turismo alternativo a las mujeres en el Sur Global y, en concreto, nos faltan investigaciones cualitativas críticas sobre este tema. Para comprender mejor el estado de los conocimientos sobre este tema, revisamos 15 estudios sobre el turismo alternativo en el Sur Global utilizando un marco ecofeminista. Nuestra investigación ilustra los siguientes temas en la literatura publicada: 1) el turismo puede reforzar los estereotipos y roles de género (y raciales), 2) existe una división desigual del trabajo en función del género en el turismo, 3) las mujeres tienen menos acceso a la educación que los hombres y esto impide que ocupen puestos de liderazgo en el turismo, 4) incluso cuando las mujeres trabajan en el turismo, carecen de protección en lo que respecta a su seguridad personal, 5) las mujeres soportan una carga de tiempo (debida en parte a una responsabilidad desproporcionada en la gestión

■n support the renegotiation of gendered norms in turn increasing women's participation in tourism, and 8) forming part of a women's group was also reported to increase women's participation in tourism.

de los recursos naturales) que limita su capacidad para participar en el turismo, 6) el turismo puede reforzar relaciones coloniales negativas que afectan a las personas de manera diferente, 7) el turismo alternativo puede apoyar la renegociación de las normas de género y aumentar la participación de las mujeres en el turismo, y 8) formar parte de un grupo de mujeres también aumentó la participación de las mujeres en el turismo.

Keywords: feminism, gender, ecotourism, community-based tourism

Palabras clave: feminismo, género, ecoturismo, turismo comunitario

1. INTRODUCTION

The tourism industry provides 1 in 10 jobs globally (UNWTO, 2021) and two thirds of the tourism workforce are women (Figuroa-Domecq et al., 2015). Due to its economic potential, the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) describes tourism as an opportunity for women to improve their socio-economic situations, which could lead to their economic empowerment (Scheyvens, 2000). Specifically, Mrema (2015) describes empowerment as central to gender equality and "implies a society in which women and men enjoy the same opportunities, outcomes, rights, and obligations in all spheres of life" (p. 4). Mrema (2015) also highlights that central to empowerment is addressing power imbalances and ensuring women have autonomy to manage their own lives. Despite that two thirds of the tourism workforce are women, most of the women working in tourism are working in domestic-type jobs such as cooking and cleaning (Brown & Hall, 2008). Working in this domestic sector does not always fulfil an empowerment potential as it can reinforce conventional gender norms (Swain, 1995) and it does not often lead to opportunities in leadership positions (Brown & Hall, 2008). The latter gap in leadership positions is exemplified in the UNWTO report (2019) that describes an absence of women in managerial and technical roles in tourism. Moreover, domestic-like work does not enhance women's decision-making power (Cole, 2016). The domestic-like jobs mirror the unpaid labour women are often responsible for at home, thus making them perform a double day of similar tasks which can sometimes lead to a feeling of neglect towards child care and religious or social obligations (Irandu & Shah, 2016). This work may bring some level of economic empowerment, but it fails to increase women's status, thus failing at empowering them politically, psychologically and socially (Scheyvens, 2000).

There is a growing body of literature on gender and tourism, however, this literature has a few key gaps. Specifically, Figuroa-Domecq et al. (2015) analysed 466 gender and tourism articles and found that tourism studies are dominated by marketing-oriented research, mostly coming from business and management schools. Secondly, these authors found that research in this field predominantly focused on the following themes: 1) how men and women travel differently, 2) the gendered impacts of tourism on host communities, 3) gendered labour and sexist work practices, and 4) a small amount of literature on theory building. Figuroa-Domecq et al. (2015) reported the following gaps in gender and tourism research: 1) a lack of qualitative research on gender and tourism, and specifically feminist critical analyses, and 2) a greater emphasis on how gender

intersects with other vectors of oppression (i.e., race, class, disability). A growing number of qualitative scholars have called for a methodological disruption of the dominant post-positive approach to tourism research (Ivanova et al., 2021) since such qualitative analyses have been essential to uncover uneven power dynamics and contextual complexities and to increase reflexivity in analyses (Ivanova et al., 2021; Wilson & Hollinshead 2015; Belsky, 2004).

Another gap in gender and tourism research is the lack of feminist analyses regarding tourism and the environment (Ivanova et al., 2021). Although Swain (1995) recommended including gender in environmental tourism research over 25 years ago, gendered analysis of environmental issues is still widely overlooked (Cole, 2016). This article therefore addresses multiple gaps in the field: 1) first the purpose of this paper is to better understand what impacts alternative tourism development had on women in the global South, 2) this is a qualitative critical feminist analysis, an area that has been identified as a key gap (Ivanova et al, 2021; Figueroa-Domecq et al. 2015), and 3) we specifically analyse case studies that are linked to women and the environment.

It is important to note that gender identity can be different from person to person. However, within the gender and tourism literature, it is widely understood as the relationships between men and women, which are conducive for the latter's subordination (Swain, 1995); however, we note that there is a need to move beyond gender binaries in such analyses. In our research, since we analysed existing case studies and these studies used men and women as binary categories, our findings reflect this. However, we are guided by the following definition of gender "gender is not a rigid or reified analytic category imposed on human experience, but a fluid one whose meaning emerges in specific social contexts as it is created and recreated through human action" (Gerson & Peiss 1985, p.317).

In this study we examine alternative tourism, which is defined as a type of "...development that is less commercialised and consistent with the natural, social, and community values of a host community" and tend to "provide opportunities for relationships between locals and tourists" (Gursoy et al. 2010, p. 381). In alternative tourism, there is also a focus on contact among local peoples, tourists and the natural environment (Smith & Eadington 1992). Its purpose is to provide an alternative to "...large numbers of visitors, to clumsy and unregulated development, to environmental destruction, to social alienation and homogenization" caused by "mass tourism" (Triarchi & Karamanis, 2017, p.2). There are various overlapping definitions of alternative tourism in academia, however, one common factor in most definitions is that it opposes mass tourism in theory and practice (Triarchi & Karamanis, 2017). The promises of alternative tourism for equality and sustainability should not position it beyond criticism, it should rather be rigorously assessed to analyse its impacts on host communities (Scheyvens, 2000). Our aim is to better comprehend the environmental and social impacts of alternative tourism, through an ecofeminist lens which seeks to speak from the position of women and nature (Alaimo, 1994).

2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1. Ecofeminism

Ecofeminism originated as a critique of sexism in ecological movements as well as a need to mainstream environmental issues in women's movements (Plumwood, 2004); since its origins, it

has transformed into a theoretical framework, a political movement, and a personal affiliation, whose definition may slightly vary depending upon cosmology of the person using it (Ojeda et al. 2022). Common to ecofeminism, however, is the tenant that the oppression of women and nature are interconnected (Svampa, 2021). Furthermore, ecofeminists have advocated for social change that will lead to a new world that centres care, respect, reciprocity and healing (Svampa 2021; Mies & Shiva, 1993; Carlassare, 2000). Here we provide an overview of ecofeminism and its key concepts that have guided our research and analysis.

Ecofeminism has contributed to the critique of how a Western epistemology has contributed to gender and environmental crises. Specifically, ecofeminist critiques illustrate how Western dualisms such as nature/culture, mind/body, male/female, humanity/animality, and reason/emotion have created hierarchies that commodify women and other feminised bodies as well as nature (Navarro & Gutiérrez, 2018; Plumwood, 2004). More specifically, these dualisms have created power dynamics where the 'higher' side of these oppositional concepts have been associated with the masculine elite, a perspective that then posits nature as inferior to humans and women (and other feminised bodies) as inferior to men. As Plumwood states, dualisms, such as that of human/nature have been "functional for Western culture in enabling it to exploit the non-human world and so-called 'primitive' cultures with less constraint..." (2004, p. 44). Ecofeminists call for a rethinking of these categories if we want to liberate feminised bodies, as well as nature, from existing forms of violence (Svampa, 2021; Plumwood, 2004).

Ecofeminists foreground an analysis of care economies and their relationships to women and the protection of nature. Ecofeminist scholars have demonstrated how women and other feminised beings are disproportionately involved in care economies (Ojeda et al. 2022). Specifically these scholars highlight how care economies sustain both life and the protection of nature and how women's work in these care economies has been made invisible and has been undervalued by dominant patriarchal, capitalist relations (Svampa, 2021; Navarro & Gutiérrez 2018; Herrero, 2019).

Ecofeminist scholars have also demonstrated how women, feminised bodies, and the environment have been subject to similar forces of oppression via capitalist economic and colonial relations (Ojeda et al. 2022; Herrero, 2019; Mies 1986). Capitalism seeks to generate profit via maximising the use value of nature, natural resources, and the systems of production without allowing for system renewal or an emphasis on care (Plumwood 2004, Mies & Shiva 1993). Appropriating women's bodies has been this capitalist process of primitive accumulation (Federici, 2004). Ecoterritorial and anticolonial feminists examine a form of triple violence on territories/bodies, by means of extractivism, colonialism, and the patriarchy (Svampa 2021). These ecoterritorial and anticolonial feminists examine how gender and sexual violence have been used intentionally as tools of colonial extraction, particularly in Indigenous communities (Ojeda et al. 2022; Svampa 2021). Anticolonial feminisms have contributed to this conversation by highlighting how extractivism disproportionately affects not only women but those assigned to subordinate positions because of their gender, sexuality, ability, age, race, ethnicity and other differences regarding identity (Ojeda et al. 2022). Thus, ecofeminism and other feminist ecologies have illustrated how to better understand environmental issues, the focus needs to be on the link among the land/territory and the body (Ojeda et al. 2022, Svampa 2021). Similarly, Indigenous women have emphasised the need to centre the territory-body nexus as collective space for healing from the interrelated colonial, capitalist, patriarchy (Svampa 2021).

Via ecofeminist research, we can also observe how women, and other feminised beings, can be closer to nature because of the spaces they operate in (Cole, 2016). As such, ecofeminists report how women may be the first to detect environmental and community health issues (Svampa 2021). Mies and Shiva (1993) report how this heightened sense of awareness can be even greater for women of the Global South that depend highly on natural resources. Furthermore, this awareness can be especially strong for Indigenous women whose identity can be linked with the natural world.

Based on the rich theorising in ecofeminism and feminist ecologies, we have applied this lens to our analysis of alternative tourism. Specifically, we have examined the impacts of alternative tourism on women in the published literature in the Global South with our analysis centering around the concepts of ecofeminism presented above. The analysis of our results was also carried out with links to the wider ecofeminist literature.

3. METHODOLOGY

3.1. Data Gathering

This is a qualitative study, with the objective of better understanding of how alternative tourism affects women in the Global South. To identify studies regarding gender, tourism, and the environment, we used document analysis (Bowen 2009). To find the documents (peer-reviewed research in this case), we used a keyword search in academic databases using the following key word searches: "women & alternative tourism in the South", "women empowerment and alternative tourism", "alternative tourism and gender", "gender and alternative tourism in the South". We then swapped the term "alternative" for other terms that can be used to identify this form of tourism including: ecotourism, community-based, rural, sustainable, mountain, adventure, indigenous, and cultural tourism. From the studies our key word search revealed, we only selected studies that focused on alternative tourism (fitting our above definition), and fit the following criteria, i.e., the study 1) analysed an aspect of gender and tourism in relation to the environment, 2) focused on one geographical area in the Global South, 3) published after the year 2000, and 4) included primary data. Fifteen studies fit all four criteria (Table 1). We acknowledge that other case studies likely exist in other languages. We are limiting our analysis to the English language literature and thus future work may aim to analyse similar cases in other languages, and thus, build upon our analysis and findings.

3.2. Case Studies

Table 1 summarises the 15 case studies analysed. Hereafter in this article, we will refer to each case study by its number (assigned in Figure 1) and by the country in which the research took place.

Case Study	Country	Author(s)	Time of research	Year of publishing	Scale of study
1	Egypt	S. Khalil	2018	2018	Region
2	Tanzania	A.A. Mrema	2011	2015	District
3	China	X. Feng	2002-2011	2013	Region

4	Thailand	A. Trupp and S. Sunanta	2008-2014	2017	Region
5	Uganda	B. Boonabaana	2009-2011	2014	Town
6	Guatemala	L. Usher and D.B. Morais	2006-2008	2010	Region
7	Nepal	S. KC	2010	2012	Region
8	Papua-New-Guinea	C. Foley, S. Grabowski-Faulkner, J. Small and S.L. Wearing	2009	2018	Village
9	Oman	G.M.H. Afifi and N. Al-Sherif	01-08 2013	2014	Country
10	Kenya	E. Irandu and P. Shah	Undisclosed	2014	Towns
11	South Africa	S.P. Tshabalala and I.O. Ezeudji	Undisclosed	2016	Province
12	Indonesia	S. Cole	04-07 2015	2017	Town
13	Costa Rica	D. Vandergrift	1996-2006	2008	Town
14	India	U.K. De	2009-2010	2013	State
15	Peru	A. Ypeij	2003-2007	2012	Touristic and residential area (Machu Picchu)

Figure 1. The 15 case studies analysed. Source: Own elaboration (2021).

3.3. Data Analysis

To analyse each case, we carried out qualitative thematic analysis (Ryan & Bernard 2003). We used a deductive (a priori themes) and an inductive approach (themes emerged in-vivo from the data). Our a priori themes were taken from the principles of ecofeminism and included: 1) Feminism, 2) Environment, and 3) North-South Relations; these themes are the headings of our results and discussion section. The sub-themes of each section emerged in-vivo from the data.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results from this document analysis have been organised in three overarching categories: 1) Feminism 2) Environment, 3) North/South Relations.

4.1. Feminism

4.1.1. Gender stereotypes and roles

Gender stereotypes can be one of the causes of women's subordination (Sultana, 2011). As a "system of culturally constructed identities" (Swain, 1995, P.258), gender identities will change from one community to the other, with some similarities imposed by the dominant system that is patriarchy. A patriarchal system subdues women with the help of the exaggeration of male and female differences, which crystallises women in a position of fragility, and men in a position of power and responsibility (Sultana, 2011).

Two words emerged from the case studies pertaining to this cultural imprisonment of patriarchal hegemony: stereotypes and roles. Gender roles stem from the stereotypes attributed to each gender which will then lock that person into a socially defined role. Despite the advantage of being at the top of the hierarchy, some case studies showed that both men and women suffer from these stereotypes. For example, in case study 5 in Uganda, Boonabaana (2014) explains that it is mostly men of Mukono Parish who work in the forest nearby. This forest was then taken by the government to develop Gorilla tourism in the area. Consequently, a lot of the men were out of work and fell into excessive alcohol consumption, in part for failure of fulfilling their roles as the "breadwinners" of the household. The gender role of a man as a breadwinner was mentioned by four of the case studies.

Mies (1993) explained how the use of the term breadwinner can lead to the discourse of a woman as someone who is "...weak, childish and dependent on a breadwinner and the state" (p.146). This stereotype applies to men but also gravely impacts women by dispossessing them of their autonomy and agency. Women in dependent positions are more vulnerable because they do not have resources to bargain with to impact their husband's behaviours (Horne et al., 2013). This dependency is also maintained through "compulsory heterosexuality", the assumption that women will want to marry a man and reproduce, which locks women in a unique path of dependence (Gerson & Peiss, 1985).

Beyond pressures that weigh on men related to stereotypes of a man as a breadwinner, our results also showed that women endure extreme pressure to remain inside the boundaries of dominant and heteronormative gender roles and these women experience severe retribution, sometimes violence, when stepping outside of these boundaries. Specifically, researchers noted that women were victims of domestic verbal and/or physical abuse when they expressed to their husbands that they wished to work in tourism. These patterns were reported in case studies that explored "bride wealth" (case study 3 in China, case study 5 in Uganda and case study 12 in Indonesia). In some communities represented in these three case studies, it was reported as customary for the men to "acquire" a wife and therefore expect her to fulfil her role perfectly and commit to it. The concept of "acquiring" exacerbates power imbalances between men and women because the woman who is "acquired" loses her agency. In case study 12 in Indonesia, a married woman reported that it was no surprise to her that her husband did not help with household chores or collecting water since he had bought her (Cole, 2017). As Horne et al. (2013) explain, "Bride wealth traditionally gives a man the right to a woman's reproductive and domestic services..." (p.506).

Another gender stereotype that appeared was of women being motherly and domestic by nature. In the case study 7 from Nepal, a man who was interviewed about women working in tourism said, "Initially, women are meant to be the ones taking care of household and are motherly by nature. Men do all the strength acquiring works." (KC, 2012, p.42). These stereotypes contribute to the subordination of women to men. The ideas of "masculine" and "feminine" characteristics were created by the patriarchy to keep women subdued, and this belief that women are motherly maintains them within the domestic realm (Sultana, 2011) by justifying that some work is only suitable for men.

Other case studies reported racial and ethnic stereotyping. In the case study 13 in Costa Rica, one foreign business owner explained he preferred hiring "white women workers" (Vandergrift, 2018, p.786) as his staff over Afro-Costa Rican women from the area. His argument was that black women are "dominant...and used to being in charge" (Vandergrift, 2018, p.786), which subsequently excluded black women from benefiting from tourism. The latter example clearly illustrates how the intersection of gender and race leads to white women, from outside the community, benefiting more from tourism. The latter also demonstrates how due to these racist stereotypes, afro-descendant black women can be excluded from the benefits of tourism in the community. Anticolonial feminisms have highlighted the intersections among race and gender and how capitalist, extractive industries can disproportionately affect not only women but those assigned to subordinate positions because of their gender, sexuality, ability, age, race, ethnicity, and other differences regarding identity (Ojeda et al. 2022).

4.1.2. Gendered Division of Labour

All case studies highlighted the gendered division of labour. It is repeatedly asserted that for many communities, there is a socio-cultural acceptance of binary and predestined gendered roles being that men belong to the public sphere and women belong to the domestic sphere (Feng, 2013; KC, 2012; Trupp & Sunanta, 2017; Tshabalala & Ezeuduji, 2016). The arrival of tourism without addressing the idea that women work in the domestic sphere can then maintain a gendered division of labour (Swain 1995). Scholars in the reviewed case studies reported how women involved in tourism tend to hold jobs cleaning, cooking and other informal jobs indirectly linked to tourism (Mrema, 2015; Boonabaana, 2014; Usher & Morais, 2010; Irandu & Shah, 2016; Tshabalala & Ezeuduji, 2016; Vandergrift, 2008). The latter is due in part to the structural issues of discrimination where women are expected, and/or socialised to work in the domestic sphere (Cole 2017; Trupp & Sunanta, 2017)

Thus, these studies clearly illustrate that women's work performed in tourism mirrors the work performed to fulfil roles of the domestic sphere. Working informally or in cooking and cleaning means that women are vulnerable to job insecurity, low wages, and psychological stress and sexual harassment (Khalil, 2018; Trupp & Sunanta, 2017; Vandergrift, 2008) through their lack of institutional protection.

4.1.3. Renegotiations of Gender Norms

A concept that emerged from more than half of the case studies (nine of them) was the negotiation of gender norms. Although it was seemingly difficult for researchers to affirm with certainty whether tourism had empowered or disempowered women in their studies, authors were

able to confirm that working in tourism has helped women to renegotiate gender norms. Gerson and Peiss (1985) explain that "negotiation addresses the processes by which men and women bargain for privileges and resources" (p.318) and this negotiation can happen at the household or community level.

Gerson and Peiss (1985) explain that for negotiation to take place, the assumption is that each party has a resource they control. When applying this negotiation to work in tourism at the community level, we can take groups of men as those that generally control the higher-status employment with more security, stability and higher wages, something some groups of women are trying to access. In tourism, women commonly control the household sphere and their spaces of informal employment in tourism. Within this negotiation of gender norms, there is a bargain taking place to share some of the resources among both parties (Gerson & Peiss, 1985). One way these negotiations can be reified is when women acquire more financial capital and men are responsible for some of the household duties.

Although rare, these negotiations were reported in one of the case studies reviewed. In case study 5 in Uganda, the author mentions several men had gone to the community management office to request that their wives or daughters be employed. Gerson and Peiss (1985) claim that even though negotiations do not always cause profound systemic changes, they can significantly improve people's lives and change community's ideas and prejudices. Thus, in future research it will be important to study how such spaces of negotiation can challenge inequitable gender norms and what factors support such negotiations.

4.1.4 Women's groups

Case studies noted that women's lives had considerably improved after the creation of a women's group. The creation of a group gives a sense of community within a community, and it brings social empowerment (Scheyvens, 2000). Six case studies noted that marginalised women formed groups to support each other and have a better chance at being heard politically. In case study 5 in Uganda, certain women had formed a support group for the women who worked in tourism so they could exchange tips on how to fulfil their dual workloads in both the home and the workplace.

Another example of women's communities was in case study 8 in Papua New Guinea, where women asked to be interviewed in focus groups that were only with other women. Some of these women communicated that they did not feel heard by the men and therefore developed shyness around them when expressing their ideas. Once they were in a group with only women, they expressed their ideas for the community. In case study 3 in China, the Miao women gathered to gain visibility from tourists and the outside world (Feng, 2013). The author wrote that women "formed a cooperation of business and a coalition of support for each other in the local marketplace" (Feng, 2013, p.7).

The authors of case study 6 in Guatemala wrote "by being part of a group outside their household, the need for relatedness in achieving self-determination" could be met (Usher & Morais, 2010, p.92). In case study 11 in South Africa, women would gather to form a pressure group to get more support from the municipality. Similarly, the authors noted that the study participants mentioned the need for a group for black entrepreneurs of all genders. This is coherent with Scheyvens'

(2000) theory of social and psychological empowerment. Women's groups can help women gain self-confidence, self-reliance and pride while simultaneously reinforcing community cohesion (Scheyvens, 2000) as well as creating a new territory where they feel safe. "The emergence of alternative framings of territory are often rooted in the resurgence of ancient and continuing relational values and practices, their reinstatement, or the reinvention of relations and understandings under new conditions" (Ojeda et al., 2022, p.159).

4.1.5. Differential access to education

Some case studies identified common institutional obstacles to women benefiting from tourism. The first one and most prevailing one across the case studies (7 out of 15 studies) is the education gap between men and women in a lot of communities. The education gap is gendered but intersects with a lot of other aspects of identity. In case study 14 in India, the author notes that in Meghalaya (a touristic region in North-East India), improving women's education has improved their opportunities for employment, regardless of wage gaps. However, the author points out that the educational opportunities for women have not yet reached indigenous communities located in rural areas. This education gap results in men occupying the highest status/pay jobs such as managers but also hotel and restaurant staff. This pattern is also seen in case study 6 in Guatemala, where women who lived in the main town had access to education, thus benefiting from tourism business opportunities now, but the indigenous women from the surrounding villages did not. The authors explain that young girls are economically active or performing household duties when their mothers go to work, which keeps them from attending school. The illiteracy and lack of Spanish skills (the official colonial language of Guatemala) that resulted from this non-attendance have been a major obstacle for them to access formal employment opportunities.

4.1.6. Social Support & Safety

The case studies have also shown that if women manage to overcome the many obstacles in their way to a successful career in tourism, more institutional barriers emerge. In case study 2 in Tanzania, tourism provided opportunities and a form of empowerment to some women of the community. However, empowerment and opportunities cannot be harnessed to the fullest without social security that can protect women against various risks such as health issues, natural disasters, or economic shocks (Mrema, 2015). They write, "a social security system is needed to enable empowered women to alleviate poverty through tourism while protecting them against risks" (Mrema, 2015, p.10). Case study 7 in Nepal illustrates this need for social security and awareness of its use with a woman who worked as a porter for mountain trekkers in Western Nepal. She hurt her back on the job, but she had no awareness or training on how to claim insurance. The author reported that most women do not know who to turn to in these cases and consequently experience financial loss (KC, 2012).

Moreover, women who work in tourism also lack protection when it comes to their personal security. In some cases, women who work as street vendors revealed they did not trust the police to defend them when they had been victims of tourists because the police tend to side with the tourist. In case study 4 in Thailand, case study 11 in South Africa and case study 15 in Peru, women who work as street vendors reported harassment from the police who would chase them away, fine them and sometimes bribe them and even confiscate their merchandise. A street vendor in

Thailand explained she sometimes could not afford to pay for food because the police officers had asked for a substantial bribe.

4.2. Environment

Congruent with ecofeminist theory, this study found that women of marginalised communities are impacted by their environment differently than men.

4.2.1. Women's responsibility for natural resources

Mies and Shiva (1993) posit that women are closer to nature than men, not because of their gender but because of their socially constructed relationship with it. For these scholars, proximity to nature is also related to class, geography, and social status. Ojeda et al. (2022) write, "As women undertake most of the care work needed in order to guarantee social reproduction, they are often the first to notice environmental transformations and take on the additional work needed in order to survive heightened environmental pressures" (p.154). The case studies examined in this study confirm that women of marginalised communities are closer to nature because they are responsible for natural resources within the household and that they notice firsthand environmental transformations. The types of tasks women of marginalised communities were reported as responsible for included fetching wood (case study 7 in Nepal and case study 14 in India), working in agricultural fields (case study 3 in China, case study 5 in Uganda and case study 8 in Papua New Guinea), providing water to the home and family (case study 12 in Indonesia) and providing and cooking food.

This latter work adds to the unpaid and unrecognised labour women perform and means they are confronted with natural resource scarcity and contamination daily (Cole, 2016). Such activities fall into the category of "reproduction" work, pertaining mainly to household labour and supporting activities outdoors as opposed to "production" work which belongs to the economic sphere of capitalism (Plumwood, 2004). In this context, reproduction is understood "as including both women's labour and the non-human ecological conditions on which production depends" (Plumwood, 2004, p.47). Tourism as a tool of economic development seeks to produce and therefore relies on nature's and local women's reproduction work to insure its continuity.

In a capitalist system based on production, labour tends to be "rewarded" with economic gain. However, the reviewed case studies have shown that women's ties to natural resources were more of a burden than an opportunity for economic gain. Being responsible for a large portion of the natural resources required for reproductive work takes away time from women's paid work; a trend previously reported in the literature (Sylvester & Little, 2020). For example, in Indonesia, case study 12 illustrated that scarce water access was a constraint that mainly affected women. Since the arrival of tourism on the island of Labuan, the price of water rose and running water would only run a few hours a day at irregular times. Since women are traditionally responsible for household chores in the domestic sphere, it fell on their shoulders to stay at home and wait for the water to run, and thus became an obstacle to their ability to get paid work. .

Extractivism is "is the organisation of production without reciprocity in such a way that the net result is extraction of value with uneven or no return for what is given or what is taken away" (Ojeda et al., 2022, p.163). Case study 12 in Indonesia has reified a material example of extractivism

as the industry of tourism has increased the number of hotels, increased water consumption and left scarce access to water for the inhabitants of the island. However, it could be argued that tourism in itself is an extractivist activity. As alternative tourism gains popularity, it produces an economic value for nature as it sells "alternative" routes of tourism such as gorilla safaris (case study 5), hiking trails in the mountains (case study 7 & case study 8) waterfalls and tropical forests (case study 11). Therefore, alternative tourism "produces" a tour in nature and extracts value from nature without attention to the reproductive sphere, which includes caring for the land and the people, as well as maintaining and restoring.

Women's knowledge of natural resources and the environment could be an asset for women and their whole communities if it was valued properly. However, the capitalist system has taken away the value of this labour and knowledge because it falls outside of the "production-boundary" (Shiva 1993, p.166). In case study 5, in Uganda, the lines between women and nature seem to blur as women's value within their community is quantified by how well-maintained their garden is. One participant of the study said, "a woman that does not cultivate is nothing, even if she has a salaried job...no respect for a woman without a garden" (Boonabaana, 2014). This example reifies once again how women are considered valuable within the domestic, private, natural sphere where reproduction work is performed and fall outside the public, cultural, economic realm of production (Plumwood, 2004).

4.3. North/South Relations

4.3.1. Otherness

Six case studies used the expression "the Other" to refer to the ostracising of women and people considered social minorities. The construction of Otherness is mostly built from a dominant standpoint. It is therefore logical, as explains Aitchison (2001), that in a patriarchal society, otherness refers to women. Mies and Shiva (1993) believe that this assumption of 'superiority' comes from what they call the capitalist patriarchy. They explain, "... capitalist patriarchy or 'modern' civilisation is based on a cosmology and anthropology that structurally dichotomises reality, and hierarchically opposes the two parts to each other: the one always considered superior, always thriving, and progressing at the expense of the other" (1993, p.5). The "Other" englobes all that is in the position of the oppressed.

Case study 4, in Thailand, and case study 15, in Peru, have used the phrase "backward Other" to describe the divisive view of minorities by the majority of the population. As Aitchison (2001) explained, the inferiorisation of the Other is common as its construction contrasts "the Same", and the Same is known by the subject so it is implicitly superior. She calls the receiving end of this process "the sub-altern Other" (2001). Case study 4 in Thailand and case study 15 in Peru illustrate these statements with their depiction of the treatment of indigenous populations. In both case studies, "the Same" is the group, with common habits, culture and language, and the Other is that which has different habits, culture and language (i.e, indigenous populations).

The term "exotic Other" was observed several times in the context of guest-host relations. This is in concordance with D'Hautserre's (2009) argument that exoticism and Otherness are constructed from similar imperial origins. The construction of exoticism in Westerner's minds is a form of Otherness mixed with mysticism, which has been a driving force of tourism for many decades

(D'Hautserre, 2009). The mystification of women and nature makes them more vulnerable to processes of domination and risk ostracising them further from "culture" in the "nature/culture" dichotomy (Alaimo, 1994). Tourists go to the global South to meet the "exotic Other" that they imagined based on anthropological accounts, the media, novels and the glorification of "explorers" maintained by adventure tourism (Salazar, 2013).

4.3.2. *Relationships with tourists*

Tourism is not accessible to everyone; it is accessible to the wealthiest (D'Hautserre, 2009), meaning that predominantly people from industrialised countries, also called the global North, are able to be tourists (Brown & Hall, 2008). Therefore, the concept of tourism departs with inequalities between guests and host communities. The guests are the tourists, the leisured customers and the hosts are the local communities, the working producers (Swain, 1995). The hosts produce experiences, entertainment, comfort, and material souvenirs for the guests to consume. The tourist travels to focus on their identity, on their Self (Lyons and Wearing, 2008), to search and explore "virgin" territories (Mies, 1993; Salazar, 2013), to break the routine and to meet Otherness (Ceriani et al., 2005) and to seek a unique personal experience (Brown & Hall, 2008).

Alternative tourists often pride themselves in thinking they have a positive impact on local communities and the environment (Salazar, 2013). However, their actual impact is intertwined with power dynamics often rooted in history and current global economics. In multiple case studies reviewed, the communities researched were indigenous. A few of the case studies mentioned that women were performing what was expected of them to seem more authentic, consequently being able to sell their product. In case study 15 in Peru, the tour guides have a significant influence on which women will be able to approach tourists. Often, the tour guides would tell the tourists that the women were not authentic indigenous women and thus did not deserve the tourists' money. In case study 4 in Thailand, the Akha women were popular because of their indigenous outfits. The Akha men's outfits were considered less exotic.

In these two previously mentioned case studies and case study 6 in Guatemala, it was found by the researchers that the governments of these countries were promoting indigenous women's identities as a product of tourism, even though these indigenous women were marginalised socially, politically and institutionally within that country. It is usually indigenous women that are represented rather than men because of the cultural expectation that women "embody" indigeneity better and because of the tourist's desire to meet the "feminised Other" (Aitchison, 2001; Ypeij, 2012). These indigenous women became a tourism product to be consumed by the tourists (Aitchison, 2001). Moreover, the glorification of Indigenous cultures often fails to create meaningful respect for them and reinforces stereotypes of exoticism by solidifying the observer's sense of being "real" (Alaimo, 1994).

They represent themselves as "authentic" to respond to tourism demands. Tourists feel an experience is "authentic" when they have been in touch with their "real Self" (Wang, 1999, p.351). Authenticity is sought by those that want to witness the past, the "original" way of life of other people who have not "developed" like Westerners (Chhabra et al., 2003). Authenticity represents the Western anthropological dream of "virgin territory" and "original people" where the Western man has not yet had an impact (Mies, 1993; Salazar, 2013; D'Hautserre, 2009). This perception of

authenticity illustrates the power dynamics still at play between the North and the South in tourism. Tourists from the North want to fulfil their need for authenticity by travelling to the South, which consequently encourages communities of the South to represent what is expected of them (Salazar, 2013). However, the author of case study 15 in Peru, claims the idea of “performed authenticity” is problematic. She writes, “Gender, ethnicity, and tourism work are in constant movement (...) The workers may draw on different dimensions of their identities in different situations, and their work with tourists is an integral part of those identities” (Ypeij, 2012, p.21).

Ceriani et al. (2005) assert that tourism needs to strike a balance between presenting otherness to the tourist, but also not presenting too much of it so that the tourist does not get shocked. This assertion is illustrated by Tshabalala & Ezeuduji (2016) in case study 11 in South Africa where a lot of white tourists would only go to white-owned shops. They write, “one of the underlying reasons behind this behaviour may be found in the perception that White business owners are more reliable than Black business owners, especially among European tourists” (p.27). Such behaviours are similar to the process of colonialism which is, alongside capitalism, a regime of extractivism (Ojeda et al., 2022).

Women who work in tourism are involved in strong power dynamics that control the tourism market, in which they must adapt to the ever-changing desires of the tourists. The tourists who wanted to have a low impact on local communities, unknowingly participate in the maintenance of complicated gender and colonial relations that subdue women.

5. CONCLUSIONS

5.1. Conclusions

We analysed 15 case studies that explored the relationship between alternative tourism and gender, in studies related to nature and the environment. Tourism and its alternative forms have undeniably brought important opportunities to better women’s lives. Some women have built a successful business, others have started negotiating gender norms within their communities. However, tourism has also been shown to have dramatic consequences on the same communities that also benefit from it.

Our analysis illustrates that the following areas need attention in alternative tourism: 1) how tourism can reinforce gendered (and racial) stereotypes and roles, i.e, those of a man as a breadwinner, those of women being associated with the domestic sphere, and those of black women as being challenging to work with, 2) the uneven gendered division of labour in tourism, where women’s work is predominantly in the domestic sphere which means they are more vulnerable to job insecurity, low wages, and as sexual harassment, due to a lack of institution protection, 3) women’s differential access to education as compared with men precludes women occupying leadership positions in tourism, 4) how even when women work in tourism, they lack protection regarding personal security, 5) women carry a time burden (due in part to a disproportionate responsibility for natural resources management) that limits their ability to be involved in tourism, 6) despite alternative tourism being described as having a potential positive impact on local communities and the environment, more attention is needed to ensure that such tourism does not reinforce negative colonial relationships that affect people differently (i.e.,

reinforcing the stereotype that indigenous women embody indigeneity better than men which can lead to tokenism of indigenous women).

Our analysis also illustrates some ways that alternative tourism supports gender equity. Specifically, studies illustrated how alternative tourism has been a space for the renegotiation of gendered norms to support women's participation in tourism (although the data were not always specific as to how this has led to meaningful empowerment in the long term). We found that women's groups were important to support women's participation in business and to create spaces where women felt comfortable sharing their needs. Lastly, the studies did not only talk about gender specific groups, but also the need to support race specific groups in tourism to support intersectional equity (i.e., groups of black entrepreneurs in South Africa).

REFERENCES

- Afifi, G. and Al-Sherif, N. (2014). Women occupational empowerment in the Omani tourism sector. *European Journal of Tourism, Hospitality and Recreation. De Gruyter*, (5) 1, pp. 53-84. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781845416157-005>
- Aitchison, C. (2001). Theorizing Other discourses of tourism, gender and culture. *Tourist Studies. Sage Journals*, (1) 2, pp. 133-147. [doi:10.1177/146879760100100202](https://doi.org/10.1177/146879760100100202)
- Alaimo, S. (1994). Cyborg and Ecofeminist Interventions: Challenges for an Environmental Feminism. *Feminist Studies*. (20) 1, pp. 133-152.
- Belsky, J. (2004). Contributions of qualitative research to understanding the politics of community ecotourism. *Qualitative Research in Tourism. Ontologies, Epistemologies and methodologies*. Routledge. pp. 273-289.
- Boonabaana, B. (2014). Negotiating gender and tourism work: Women's lived experiences in Uganda. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 14(1-2), 27-36. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358414529578>
- Bowen, G.A. (2009), "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method", *Qualitative Research Journal*, (9) No. 2, pp. 27-40. <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>
- Brown, F., & Hall, D. (2008). *Tourism and Development in the Global South: The Issues*.

- Third World Quarterly*, 29(5), 839–849.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/20455078>
- Carlassare, E. (2000). Socialist and Cultural Ecofeminism: Allies in Resistance. *Ethics and the Environment*, 5(1), 89–106.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/27766057>
- Ceriani, G., Duhamel, P., Knafou, R. & Stock, M. (2005). Le tourisme et la rencontre de l'autre. Voyage au pays des idées reçues. *L'Autre*, 6, 71-82. <https://doi.org/10.3917/lautr.016.0071>
- Chhabra, D., Healy, R., & Sills, E. (2003). Staged authenticity and heritage tourism. *Annals of tourism research*, 30(3), 702-719.
- Cole, S. (2016). A gendered political ecology of tourism and water. In E. Shelton,, R. Norum, A. Thompson, & M. Mostafanezhad, , (Eds.), *Political Ecology of Tourism: Community, Power and the Environment*. Routledge
- Cole, S. (2017). Water worries: An intersectional feminist political ecology of tourism and water in Labuan Bajo, Indonesia. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 67. 14-24.
[10.1016/j.annals.2017.07.018](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2017.07.018)
- D'Hautserre, A-M. « L'altérité et le tourisme : construction du soi et d'une identité sociale », *Espace populations sociétés* [En ligne], (2009)2 ,279-291
<https://doi.org/10.4000/eps.3693>
- De, U. K. (2013). Sustainable Nature-based Tourism, Involvement of Indigenous Women and Development: A Case of North-East India. *Tourism Recreation Research*, (38) 3, pp. 311-324.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02508281.2013.11081756>
- Federici, S. (2004). *Caliban and the Witch. Women, the Body and Primitive accumulation*. Autonomedia.
- Feng, X. (2013). Women's Work, Men's Work: Gender and Tourism among the Miao in Rural China. *Anthropology of Work Review*. (34)1, pp 1-65,. DOI:[10.1111/awr.12002](https://doi.org/10.1111/awr.12002)
- Figuroa-Domecq, C., Pritchard, A., Segovia-Pérez, M., Morgan, N., & Villacé-Molinero, T. (2015). Tourism gender research: A critical

- accounting. *Annals of Tourism Research*, (529), 87-103.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2015.02.001>
- Foley, C., Grabowski-Faulkner, S., Small, J. & Wearing, S. (2018). Women of the Kokoda: From Poverty to Empowerment in Sustainable Tourism Development. *Tourism Culture & Communication*, (18)1, pp. 21-34.
<https://doi.org/10.3727/109830418X15180180585158>
- Gerson, J. M., & Peiss, K. (1985). Boundaries, Negotiation, Consciousness: Reconceptualizing Gender Relations. *Social Problems*, 32(4), 317-331.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/800755>
- Gursoy, D., Chi, C. G., & Dyer, P. (2010). Locals' Attitudes toward Mass and Alternative Tourism: The Case of Sunshine Coast, Australia. *Journal of Travel Research*. (49)3, pp 381-394.
- Herrero, Y. (2019). Apuntes introductorios sobre el Ecofeminismo.
<https://www.anticapitalistas.org/ecosocialismo/apuntes-introductorios-sobre-el-ecofeminismo-yayo-herrero/>
- Horne, C., Dodoo, F. N.-A., & Dodoo, N. D. (2013). The shadow of indebtedness: Bridewealth and norms constraining female reproductive autonomy. *American Sociological Review*, 78(3), 503-520. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0003122413484923>
- Irandu, E. & Shah, P. (2016). The Role of Ecotourism in Promoting Women Empowerment and Community Development: Some Reflections From Kenya. DOI:10.17265/2328-2169/2014.06.002
- Ivanova, M., Buda, D-M., Burrai, E. (2021). Creative and disruptive methodologies in tourism. *Tourism Geographies. An International Journal of Tourism Space, Place and Environment*. Vol (23). pp 1-10.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14616688.2020.1784992>
- KC, S. (2012). Roles and Challenges of Women in Tourism Sector

- of Western Nepal: A Micro-Ethnographic Study. *Nepal Tourism and Development Review*, 2(1), pp 32–59. <https://doi.org/10.3126/ntdr.v2i1.7379>
- Khalil, S. (2018). Women Empowerment in Marginalized Villages via Tourism: A Case of Aswan Governorate, Egypt. *International Journal of Heritage, Tourism and Hospitality*, 12(2), 19-31. doi: [10.21608/ijhth.2019.31648](https://doi.org/10.21608/ijhth.2019.31648)
- Lyons, K. & Wearing, S. (2008). Volunteer tourism as alternative tourism: Journeys beyond otherness. *Journeys of Discovery in Volunteer Tourism*. pp. 3-11.
- Mies, M. and Shiva, V. (1993). *Ecofeminism*. Zed Books.
- Mrema, A. A. (2015). Tourism and women empowerment in Monduli district, Arusha-Tanzania. *African Journal of Hospitality, Tourism and Leisure*, 4(2), pp. 1-14. http://www.ajhtl.com/uploads/7/1/6/3/7163688/article_54rrvol4_2_july-nov2015.pdf
- Navarro, M. L. & Gutiérrez, R. (2018). Claves para pensar la interdependencia desde la ecología y los feminismos. *Bajo el Volcan*. Vol. (28). pp. 45-57.
- Ojeda, D., Nirmal, P., Rocheleau, D., Emel, J. (2022). Feminist Ecologies. *Annual Review of Environment and Resources* (47). pp 149-172. <https://www.annualreviews.org/doi/10.1146/annurev-environ-112320-092246>
- Plumwood, V. (2004). Gender, Eco-feminism and the environment. *Controversies in Environmental Sociology*. Cambridge University Press. pp. 43-60.
- Ryan, G. W., and Bernard, H. R. (2003). Techniques to Identify Themes. *Field Methods*, 15(1), 85–109. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1525822X02239569>
- Salazar, N. B. (2013). "Imagineering Otherness: Anthropological Legacies in Contemporary Tourism." *Anthropological Quarterly*, vol. 86 no. 3, 2013, p. 669-696. *Project MUSE*, doi:10.1353/anq.2013.0045.
- Scheyvens, R. (2000). Promoting Women's Empowerment Through Involvement in

- Ecotourism: Experiences from the Third World. *Journals of Sustainable Tourism*, (8) 3, pp. 232-249. DOI:[10.1080/09669580008667360](https://doi.org/10.1080/09669580008667360)
- Smith, V. L. & Eadington, W. R. (1992). *Tourism Alternatives. Potentials and Problems in the Development of Tourism*. University of Pennsylvania Press, Anniversary Collections. DOI : <http://doi.org/10.9783/9781512807462>
- Sultana, A. (2012). Patriarchy and Women's Subordination: A Theoretical Analysis. *Arts Faculty Journal*, 4, 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.3329/afj.v4i0.12929>
- Sunanta, S. and Trupp, A. (2017). Gendered practices in urban ethnic tourism in Thailand. *Annals of Tourism Research*, (64), pp.76-86. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2017.02.004>
- Svampa, M. (2021). Feminismos ecoterritoriales en América Latina. Entre la violencia patriarcal y extractivista y la interconexión con la naturaleza. *Documentos de Trabajo*. (2) 59. pp. 3-29. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33960/issn-e.1885-9119.DT59>
- Swain, M. B. (1995). Gender in Tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*. (22) 2, pp. 247-266. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0160-7383\(94\)00095-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/0160-7383(94)00095-6)
- Sylvester, O. and Little, M. (2020). "I came all this way to receive training, am I really going to be taught by a woman?" Factors that support and hinder women's participation in agroecology in Costa Rica. *Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems*. Vol. (45), Issue 7. pp. 957-980.
- Triarchi, E & Karamanis, K. (2017). The evolution of alternative forms of Tourism: a theoretical background. *Business & Entrepreneurship Journal*. pp 1-15.
- Tshabalala, S. P. and Ezeudji, I. O. (2016). Women Tourism Entrepreneurs in KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa: Any way forward? *OECONOMIC* (12), 5, pp. 19-32.
- UNWTO (2019). World Tourism Organization. International

- Tourism Highlights, 2019 Edition. UNWTO, Madrid. <https://doi.org/10.18111/9789284421152>
- UNWTO, (2021). World Tourism Organization. *International Tourism Highlights, 2020 Edition*, UNWTO, Madrid. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18111/9789284422456>.
- UNWTO & UNDP (2017). World Tourism Organization and United Nations Development Program. *Tourism and the Sustainable Development Goals: Journey to 2030*. UNWTO, Madrid, DOI: <https://doi.org/10.18111/9789284419340>
- Usher, L. and Morais, D. B. (2010). Women's human agency and self-determination in Guatemalan tourism development. *PASOS, Revista de Turismo y Patrimonio Cultural*, (8)4, pp. 507-518. <https://www.redalyc.org/articulo.oa?id=88115181006>
- Vandergrift, D. (2008). "THIS ISN'T PARADISE—I WORK HERE": Global Restructuring, the Tourism Industry, and Women Workers in Caribbean Costa Rica. *Gender and Society*, 22(6), 778–798. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27821694>
- Wang, N. (1999). Rethinking Authenticity in Tourism Experience. *Annals of tourism research*, 26(2), 349-370. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0160-7383\(98\)00103-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0160-7383(98)00103-0)
- Wilson, E. and Hollinshead, K. (2015). Qualitative tourism research : Opportunities in the emergent soft sciences. *Annals of Tourism Research*. Vol. (54). pp. 30-47.
- Ypeij, A. (2012). The Intersection of Gender and Ethnic Identities in the Cuzco-Machu Picchu Tourism Industry: Sácamefotos, Tour Guides, and Women Weavers. *Latin American Perspectives*, 39(6), 17–35. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41702291>